

AUSTRALIAN ACADEMY OF LITURGY

# AUSTRALIAN JOURNAL OF LITURGY

Volume 11 Number 3

# AUSTRALIAN JOURNAL OF LITURGY

Volume 11 Number 3 2009

# EDITOR ROBERT GRIBBEN

EDITORIAL PANEL
CHARLES SHERLOCK (Book Review Editor)
RUSSELL HARDIMAN
DAVID PITMAN

AJL is the journal of the Australian Academy of Liturgy and exists to further the study of liturgy at a scholarly level, and to comment on and provide information concerning liturgical matters with special reference to Australia. AJL is published twice a year.

ISSN 1030-617X

### Editorial

I preached my first sermon on 'An Autumnal Easter' in May 1980 at the Bailgate Methodist Church in Lincoln, UK, where I was ecumenical lecturer at the Anglican Theological College. My Easter Day that year had involved driving through the snowy fen to conduct the service in a tiny rural chapel which was crammed with daffodils. The triumph of Spring over Winter was palpable. But I found myself disturbed: could this symbol carry the Christian doctrine of the resurrection? 'Did Jesus merely hibernate, like a bear in a cave, asleep for three days, only to emerge again in a perfectly natural process?' I cried from the high pulpit. 'Did Jesus' saying about the seed having to die mean, in his case, that he merely went into a seasonal decline, with the promise of new life already dormant within him, needing only the sunshine to draw him forth?' I then dared to suggest that those of us who live in the temperate part of the southern hemisphere were privileged to be able to preach the resurrection against a natural background where all around us was dving. I think Dante also located Paradise Down Under. Well, there is a theological point (see I Cor. 15), and it was the theme for the annual conference of the Academy this year, anticipating the Societas Liturgica congress in Sydney.

Several of the papers from the AAL conference are in this issue. Clare Johnson's keynote address takes us far beyond weather patterns into a critical examination of the notion of time in relation to the Roman Catholic liturgy. John Bunyan (Anglican) and Alison Whish (Uniting) both reflect in terms of their pastoral experience on the hymns we sing. John offers several of his own verses; Alison explores both Australian and New Zealand contemporary composition. Nathan Nettleton (Baptist) has provided some prayers reclaiming the symbolic notes of the Antipodean seasons. Readers will find it challenging to 'compare and contrast' the theses offered here. Paul Taylor's research on chant will be of interest to all congregations who sing the eucharist Overseas readers (whom we welcome in August) will also read of some of the activities of the Australian Academy.

The Academy warmly thanks Inari Thiel for her work as Editor of *AJL* since May 2003 (vol. 8/3). Her predecessor, the founding Editor, Ray Hartley was rightly made an Honorary Life Member at our Conference. Editors, it is timely to say, largely depend on Academy members thinking of their journal when they have been preparing a paper, playing with an idea or reading a book. Please!

Robert Gribben

# Contents

Grounding the timeless in place: exploring the influence of the physical environment on liturgical conceptions of time	
Clare V. Johnson	83
A set of Prayers of Invocation for the major seasons of the Church Year, incorporating South East Australian climate imagery.	
Nathan Nettleton	108
The practice of singing chant in the Catholic archdiocese of Melbourne Paul Taylor	111
The 2009 Academy Conference: Reports and papers	
The Conference, David Pitman, President	130
Members' papers:	
Circle of the South Land John Bunyan	132
Do 'the patterns framed by nature/form the seasons of our hearts'?  Alison Whish	147
Activities of the Academy	
Western Australian Chapter	157
Visit of Fr Paul Turner STD to Australia	158
Tasmanian Chapter	159
Victorian Chapter: seminar 'Marking Mortality'	159
The Congress of Societas Liturgica, Sydney 2009 introduced by Carmel Pilcher	160
The H.F. Leatherland Exhibition	162

# AUSTRALIAN JOURNAL OF LITURGY 11/3 (2009)

# Book Reviews

ard Giles, Mark Ireland, Ann Loades and Nicola Slee,	
Journey. Renewing the Eucharist: Volume 1	
Gerard Moore	163
Elizabeth J Smith, <i>Songs for Saints and Sinners</i> . Fay Magee	165
Contributors	166

For up-to-date news and announcements – see the Academy's website <a href="http://www.liturgy.org.au">http://www.liturgy.org.au</a>

# Grounding the timeless in place: exploring the influence of the physical environment on liturgical conceptions of time. 1

### Clare V. Johnson

The Church of Christ is made present and signified in a given place and in a given time by the local or particular churches, which through the liturgy reveal the Church in its true nature. That is why every particular Church must be united with the universal Church not only in belief and sacramentals, but also in those practices received through the Church as part of the uninterrupted apostolic tradition. This includes, for example, daily prayer, sanctification of Sunday and the rhythm of the week, the celebration of Easter and the unfolding of the mystery of Christ throughout the liturgical year.<sup>2</sup>

When Christians in the Southern and equatorial parts of the world celebrate the liturgy of the universal Church through the liturgical year in our unique environmental contexts and geographic locations, there can be something of a disconnect between our local lived experience of time and season, and the traditional interpretations of liturgical time we inherit as part of our largely European-generated Christian heritage. Pinpointing the source of the conceptual and experiential dissonance this disconnect can generate and attempting to explain the reason for its existence, is a task that requires the consideration of notions of time itself (real-time, natural-time and liturgical-time), the link between time and place, the influence of the physical environment on our experience of time and the incongruity generated by temporal displacement when the time-place link is severed in the course of liturgical celebration. In exploring these ideas, this essay will uncover some of the causes of the conceptual dissonance that can occur when we attempt to celebrate the universal at the level of the local, by studying the effect that the environmentalseasonal contexts encountered in Australia can have on local understandings of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This essay is based in part on a public lecture given at the Australian Academy of Liturgy National Conference, Australian National University, Canberra, 20 January 2009. Other parts of the lecture are included in 'Relating Liturgical Time to Place-Time: The Spatio-Temporal Dislocation of the Liturgical Year in Australia.' *Christian Worship in Australia*, eds. Stephen Burns and Anita Monro (Strathfield NSW: St Pauls, 2009).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments, Fourth Instruction on the Correct Implementation of *Sacrosanctum Concilium* (nos. 37-40), *Varietates Legitimae*: On the Roman Liturgy and Inculturation *Origins* 23:43 (14 April 1994): 745, 747-756, §26. Hereafter referred to as VL.

the time-place nexus and how these in turn can effect local reception of universal Church understandings of liturgical time. It will shed light on one aspect of liturgical celebration that is often overlooked but that shapes the manner in which every local community comprehends liturgical time – the place<sup>3</sup> in which liturgy is celebrated in relation to real-time and natural-time. After highlighting the ability 'place' has to influence the mindsets, expectations and perceptual categories of local worshiping communities relative to time, this essay will investigate the necessity of inculturation of 'universal' notions of liturgical time in order to meet the particular needs and circumstances<sup>4</sup> of local worshiping communities in the varied contexts and climates of Australia.<sup>5</sup>

### 1. Considering time

In attempting to make sense of the official church language, imagery and symbolism depicting Christian understandings of liturgical time in light of our experience of real time in the here and now as it is experienced in 'place', we are drawn into a consideration of time itself, its cycles and measures, its flow and line, time as an arrow, time as a river, actual time, liturgical time, kairos (or God's time, the opportune moment), and chronos (the human experience of time extending from creation to final judgment).<sup>6</sup>

The world's great thinkers and poets, theologians and philosophers have long considered the perplexing issue of time. How are we to conceptualize and speak

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> What is intended by place here is the environment, climatic conditions and geography in which local liturgy is celebrated, rather than the liturgical buildings in which it is celebrated. <sup>4</sup> The May 2007 version of *The General Instruction of the Roman Missal* approved and promulgated by the Australian Catholic Bishops Conference notes the utmost importance of taking the circumstances of people and place into consideration when choosing and arranging the forms and elements of the liturgy. The GIRM (2007) notes: 'However because the celebration of the Eucharist, like the entire Liturgy, is carried out through perceptible signs that nourish, strengthen, and express faith, the utmost care must be taken to choose and to arrange those forms and elements set forth by the Church that, in view of the circumstances of the people and the place, will more effectively foster active and full participation and more properly respond to the spiritual needs of the faithful.' §20, p.7. Accessed via:

http://www.acbc.catholic.org.au/documents/200707031933.pdf, 21 March 2009. Hereafter referred to as GIRM (2007).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> This notion of the need for inculturation of the universal liturgical year in light of local environmental and geographic conditions as they influence the liturgical experience and religious imagination of individual local worshipping communities, can be applied to each local church community in whichever place it exists. The Australian contexts focused on here, provide just one example for consideration.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> James A. Wilde. Chronos and Kairos, *At That Time: Cycles and Seasons in the Life of the Christian*, ed. James A. Wilde (Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications, 1989), 8-9.

about something as evanescent as time? In his *Confessions*, St Augustine of Hippo addressed the mystifying nature of time, writing:

How can the past and future be when the past no longer is and the future is not yet? As for the present, if it were always present and never moved on to become the past, it would not be time but eternity.<sup>7</sup>

Fifteen centuries later, in his poem 'Burnt Norton,' T.S. Eliot, wrote:

Time present and time past are both perhaps present in time future, and time future contained in time past. If all time is eternally present all time is unredeemable.

Coming to a consensus on the meaning of time continues to be a challenging enterprise. In order to understand and analyse our experience of liturgical time in light of local Australian environmental contexts, first we must examine our definition, understanding and experience of real-time.

### 1.1 Real-time

Time is a concept that seems so obvious, that most of us generally do not stop to consider what it actually is. When St Augustine was asked the question: 'what is time?' he replied: 'I know well enough what it is, provided that nobody asks me; but if I am asked what it is and try to explain, I am baffled.' Augustine's difficulty in explaining time philosophically reflects its somewhat mysterious, ephemeral and subjective nature.

Humans living in the contemporary scientific age like to imagine that we have an easy answer to the question: 'what is time?' In some ways, like Augustine, time for us is an obvious notion that we do not question, that we take for granted, that we use every day to observe, understand and define concepts such as 'hour' and 'day' and 'week' and 'month' and 'year.' Surely we know what time is — it is a common-sense concept that we use continually. The question remains though, can we explain what time is with any more ease than Augustine?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> St Augustine, *Confessions*, trans. R.S. Pine-Coffin (Baltimore: Penguin, 1961), 11:14, p. 267-268.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> T.S. Eliot, Burnt Norton, *Collected Poems*, 1909-1962, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. (London: Faber & Faber, 1963), 189.

<sup>9</sup> St Augustine, Confessions, 267.

Time is a key measure via which we demarcate our lives, our existence, into quantifiable units, using it to note our own unique existential location in relation to our experience of time past, time in the present and time yet to come. According to a Newtonian view, time '...is simply *there*. Time cannot be affected by anything; it just goes on flowing at a uniform rate.' Many believe time to exist '...as an independently real entity, God-given and absolute.' Some would argue that time itself cannot exist – it is simply our subjective experience, measured in the remembrance of and passing of and anticipation of events which are unique to each of us personally. According to Albert Einstein, 'The distinction between past, present and future is only an illusion, even if a stubborn one.'

Time can be a somewhat fluid concept which seems to differ from person to person on a subjective level, while on an objective level its relentless and consistent passage can be marked using highly accurate, independent time-keeping apparatuses that allow for corporate agreement regarding time's measure across the world. Within the unified experience of a single person though, perceptions of time's passage can appear to fluctuate greatly as it seems to crawl when one is waiting for the dentist to complete a filling or as it seems to fly when one is absorbed by an evening of fine food, company and conversation. Beyond our experience of time's apparent quirks on an individual level, we must also acknowledge that time is a fundamentally social concept. The entire developed world has agreed to mark time synchronically, relative to Greenwich Mean Time.

The socially-agreed-upon time zone in which we live is dependent upon our geographic location on the globe relative to Greenwich, England, which marks the prime meridian, the geographic starting point from which we reckon longitude in terms of the moment of midday (the meridian) at zero degrees longitude in Greenwich. The meridian is determined according to when the sun is at the highest point of its daily arc across the sky in Greenwich. The prime meridian is an imaginary north-south line on the surface of the Earth running through Greenwich, and reaching both geographic poles of the Earth. This line marking zero longitude was chosen arbitrarily by the British in the 18<sup>th</sup> century when they were the foremost European maritime power. All other maritime nations accepted the proposal of Greenwich as prime meridian, and from the 18<sup>th</sup> century onward, it has served as the agreed-upon fixed point of reference

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Paul Davies, About Time: Einstein's Unfinished Revolution (London: Viking, 1995), 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Ibid., 54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Letter of Albert Einstein, 21 March 1955, cited in *Albert Einstein: Creator and Rebel*, by Banesh Hoffman with Helen Dukas (London: Hart-Davis, MacGibbon, 1972), 258.

which is determinative of all other degrees of longitude on the Earth. In whichever time zone we find ourselves, we divide our day into two 12-hour segments relative to the meridian: Ante Meridiem (sometimes called antemeridian, a.m.) and Post Meridiem (sometimes called post-meridian, p.m.). Our contemporary concept of 'time' then, and our local experience of the meridian (midday), is linked intimately with, and in fact is determined by the movement of celestial bodies, as they are perceived in relation to specific geographic locations. We reckon real-time according to its experience in nature and in place.

In contrast to Augustine's perplexity regarding how to define time, today, in our quest for scientific precision, the majority of humankind considers time to be an exactly measurable and impartial dimension. We keep official atomic world time according to the Bonn cesium-beam clock, <sup>13</sup> which is the 'custodian of Earth time', <sup>14</sup> and which is so precise that it mandates the addition of a leap-second on occasion (as we did at the end of 2008) in order to keep us in good time with the rotation rate of the Earth, which is not always constant, unlike the cesium-beam atomic clock, which is constant, with an accuracy to about one second in 20 million years. <sup>15</sup> Humankind has developed its scientific notion of linear time with increasing precision since the high medieval period, when it began to conceive of time as an independently existing thing, an entity in its own right. <sup>16</sup> Albert Einstein's general theory of relativity (1915) challenged the notion that space and time exist in a fixed arena within which events take place, but which is not affected by what happens in it. <sup>17</sup> Stephen Hawking explains that subsequent to the proposal of Einstein's general theory of relativity,

Space and time are now dynamic quantities: when a body moves, or a force acts, it affects the curvature of space and time — and in turn the structure of space-time affects the way in which bodies move and forces act. Space and time not only affect but are also affected by everything that happens in the universe. Just as one

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Paul Davies explains that: 'The Bonn device, and a network of similar instruments across the world, together constitute the standard clock. ...They are continually monitored, compared, tweaked and refined via radio signals from satellites and television stations, to cajole them into near-perfect step. At the International Bureau of Weights and Measures at Sèvres, not far from Paris, the data are collected, analysed and broadcast to a time-obsessed world.' *About Time*, 21.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Ibid., 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Source: <a href="http://tf.niStgov/timefreq/cesium/atomichistory.htm">http://tf.niStgov/timefreq/cesium/atomichistory.htm</a>, internet accessed 18 January 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Davies, 30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Stephen W. Hawking, A Brief History of Time: From the Big Bang to Black Holes (London: Bantam, 1988), 33.

cannot talk about events in the universe without the notions of space and time, so in general relativity it became meaningless to talk about space and time outside the limits of the universe.<sup>18</sup>

Conceiving of the universe and everything within it according to the space-time nexus remains a crucial scientific principle within which and over-against which theoretical physicists continue to operate today. For Christians though, belief that something exists beyond time, that God exists eternally (prior and subsequent to time) and that the soul after physical death continues to exist outside of time, entails mentally stepping beyond the limitations of theoretical physics and the known universe. And yet, in our experience of the 'now,' our lives are lived in terms of our limited physical existence which is constrained and mediated by our perception of time in relation to place.

Throughout history, philosophers, theologians, shamans, poets and dreamers of every race and nation, have all struggled to define and explain the concept of time which gives rise to the consequent concepts of cosmogony and eternity. Different societies have produced varying theories for explaining time, the beginning of time (Creation, The Big Bang, etc.), the end of time (Judgment Day, Apocalypse, when the universe ceases expanding, etc.) and what exists beyond time (Nirvana, the Dream Time, Heaven, Eternity, 19 to name just a few). Physicist and cosmologist Paul Davies suggests that human beings have always been challenged by the abiding tension between the temporal and the eternal, between our experience of historical or real-time and our hope of 'the everlasting.' Davies notes that: 'in our struggle to come to terms with mental and physical reality, nothing vexes us more than the nature of time.'20 There exists a complex history of thought on the concept of time, which cannot be engaged more fully here.<sup>21</sup> However, it is important to note that while today we have a broad scientific consensus on and explanation of the concept of time, as liturgists, theologians and philosophers can appreciate, there is much more to understanding time and the meaning of time than simply what science can offer.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Karl Rahner provides a fascinating essay on the notion of eternity in Eternity from Time, *Theological Investigations Vol. XIX: Faith and Ministry*, trans. Edward Quinn (New York: Crossroad, 1974/1983), 169-177.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Davies, 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> For further detail on the history and philosophy of time see for example: Paschal Richet, *A Natural History of Time*, trans. John Venerella (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007); Stephen W. Hawking, *The Illustrated A Brief History of Time* (New York: Bantam Books, 1996); Mark Currie, *About Time: Narrative, Fiction and the Philosophy of Time* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007; Roger McLure, *The Philosophy of Time: Time Before Times* (London: Routledge, 2005).

### 1.2 Natural-time

When Christians and Jews consider the notion of celebrating and marking liturgical time, we tend to take as a starting point, time understood and experienced according to the categories of nature, embodiment and emplacement. This is no accident. The very first words of our Sacred Scriptures draw us into this time-nature-place link: 'In the beginning when God created the heavens and the earth....' These iconic words sound out for us the irreducible bond between time (beginning, when) and the created universe (the heavens and the earth). In this ancient Jewish cosmogony, time is linked to place as the setting for human existence in relationship with God. In the first 26 verses of Genesis 1 God sets up over the course of the time-indicator of seven 'days,' the physical universe as the place in which humans will exist Right from the start, our Judeo-Christian religious imaginations have been calibrated to conceive of human existence in terms of place-time, that inseparable nexus which is the only state in which embodied, breathing human beings can exist Jesus Christ became human in an actual time and place in order to redeem and transform them in himself, becoming part of time and place, and rising anew from and in time and place in order that we might have the promise and hope of one day escaping the bounds of our temporal emplaced existence and enter into utopian eternity<sup>22</sup> with him.

The conceptual linkage of time and nature, time experienced and interpreted in light of nature, is inevitable also for human beings. Our natural human bodies provide us with internal means of timekeeping: the human heartbeat, the menstrual cycle, a 24-hour circadian rhythm which regulates sleep and waking and controls all the bodily cycles attendant on those states: body temperature, excretion, brain activity, breathing, eye movement, growth, hormone production<sup>23</sup> aging, etc., – all are natural bodily functions that occur within a measurable temporal frame, and which are affected by and adjusted according to the physical locations in which human beings live. We also have natural external physical means of timekeeping: the rhythm of the seasons, the motions of the stars and planets, the movement of the tides. Genesis 1:14-15 explains the origin of primitive calendars as divinely determined via to the motions of the heavenly bodies: 'And God said, 'Let there be lights in the dome of the sky to separate the day from the night; and let them be for signs and for seasons and for days and years....' The conceptual linkage of time-place and the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Utopia from the Greek *ou* (not) + *topos* (place) literally means no place or beyond place, while eternity means endless time, beyond all notions of emplaced temporality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Kevin Lynch, *What Time is This Place?* (Cambridge MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 1972), 117.

understanding of time being marked according to the categories of nature is a logical construct born of sense experience. Living, breathing human beings cannot exist, work or worship except in time and place, and this notion is present right from the beginning of the Judeo-Christian cosmogony which forms the context in and out of which our religious imaginations operate, to help us to find and access meaning in the time-places of our existence in the 'here and now.'

### Severing the time-place link

Given the apparently obvious link between time and place as the context in which human beings exist, and the virtually universal adoption of natural and biological categories as the basis for understanding the experience of the passage of time in a given location, it is somewhat surprising to find that when we come to consider the manner in which the Roman Catholic Church marks the passage of time, celebrating the feasts and seasons of the liturgical year, all too often the time-place link is severed conceptually for Christians in contexts other than the temperate Northern hemispheric norm.<sup>24</sup> What is promoted instead is a generic one-size-fits-all approach to interpreting and celebrating the presence of God in temporal human experience regardless of where that experience takes place. So extensive is the severance of the time-place link in certain official teachings on the liturgy and the liturgical year, that the Roman Catholic Church recently has begun to describe its universal liturgy as 'supraregional<sup>25</sup> meaning above, over or beyond region or place – and what is now being promoted from some quarters of the Church is a notion of 'the Liturgy' as a pristine entity that exists beyond place, beyond time and beyond culture.<sup>26</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> By temperate Northern hemispheric norm is meant the seasons as they are experienced in the temperate latitudes of the Northern hemisphere in continental Europe, the Mediterranean region, the United States of America, Canada, etc., (i.e., not the extreme North or equatorial North).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> The GIRM (2007) states: 'Throughout the ages, the Roman Rite has not only preserved the liturgical usages that arose in the city of Rome, but has also in a deep, organic and harmonious way incorporated into itself certain other usages derived from the customs and culture of different peoples and of various particular Churches of both West and East, so that in this way, the Roman Rite has acquired a certain supraregional character. In our own times, on the other hand, the identity and unitary expression of this Rite is found in the typical editions of the liturgical books promulgated by authority of the Supreme Pontiff...', §395 p. 64.

Mark R. Francis indicates [in A Response to Peter Phan, in Liturgy in a Postmodern

World, ed. Keith Pecklers (New York: Continuum, 2003), 90], that this view is evident in the GIRM (May 2007) which speaks of the authentic liturgical tradition as something to be protected from potential contamination in the process of liturgical inculturation. The GIRM (2007) states: 'Moreover inculturation requires a necessary length of time, lest authentic liturgical tradition suffer contamination due to haste and a lack of caution', §398, p. 65.

This 'timeless' view of liturgy fails to perceive that the location of its celebration has any impact on it or the people celebrating it and tends to overlook the fact that human experience of time is linked essentially and inherently with human experience of place. This 'timeless' view of liturgy also tends to underemphasise the normative evidence of liturgical change and inculturation throughout Christian history<sup>27</sup> (which as a norm will continue to occur), and envisages little need for further development and adaptation of the liturgical year to the needs and circumstances of today's peoples<sup>28</sup> which are determined largely by their experience of real-time in actual places. This 'timeless' view of the liturgy is in need of further examination.

One may well ask, what is the problem with conceiving of a liturgy that is universal, above time and beyond place? Does not the development and promotion of a generic one-size-fits-all liturgy for the Church universal highlight the abundant unity and cohesion of the Roman Catholic Church throughout the world? In one view of liturgy it does. In another view though, promoting an abstract understanding of liturgy that is largely unrelated to actual time and actual place overlooks the obvious fact that human experience and understanding of time is fundamentally linked with place, because our temporal existence is necessarily emplaced. We do not experience real-time as abstracted from place, and attempting to celebrate liturgical time, God's time, as abstracted from our actual emplaced existence in real-time, causes a sense of dislocation that can disembody and displace us, severing our social and cultural real-life, real-time identities from our spiritual liturgical identities; asking us

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> See John F. Baldovin, Reflections on *Summorum Pontificum*, *Worship* 83:2 (March 2009): 98-112 (esp. 98-104).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Redemptionis Sacramentum promotes an understanding of the Sacred Liturgy whereby "...the structures and forms of the sacred celebrations according to each of the Rites of both East and West are in harmony with the practice of the universal Church also as regards practices received universally from apostolic and unbroken tradition, which it is the Church's task to transmit faithfully and carefully to future generations. All these things are wisely safeguarded and protected by the liturgical norms.' Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments, Redemptionis Sacramentum, Origins 33 (2004): 801, 803-22, §9. In contexts such as Australia, which would be considered as a '...culture marked by indifference or disinterest in religion', Varietates Legitimae envisages that: 'In face of this situation, it is not so much a matter of inculturation, which assumes that there are preexistent religious values and evangelizes them, but rather a matter of insisting on liturgical formation and finding the most suitable means to reach spirits and hearts'. VL§8. In placing these two statements in dialogue, it appears then, that rather than liturgical inculturation being envisaged for a context such as that of Australia (marked largely by indifference or disinterest in religion), insistence on liturgical formation regarding the structures and forms of the sacred celebrations received universally from apostolic and unbroken tradition and protected by the liturgical norms, is the Church's expectation.

essentially to slough off the formation engendered by our emplaced experience as beings-in-the-world and to put on an a-cultural 'liturgical' persona in order to celebrate 'the Liturgy.' Such an approach tends to emphasize our 'distant' participation in the 'heavenly' liturgy which (hopefully) we will celebrate eternally after our deaths, rather than emphasizing our active participation in our temporally-limited, emplaced liturgy which we actually celebrate during our lives in the here and now – a real-time, real-place liturgy in which God is really present, and which is '...the action of Christ himself,' head and body at worship offering perfect praise to the Father in the here and now, transforming real-place into holy ground, and transforming real-time into sacred time without actually stepping out of either real-place or real-time.

What can be seen here is evidence of an ideological clash between two ways of conceiving the interrelation of liturgy and human culture. This clash can be witnessed when vertical and horizontal theological foci<sup>30</sup> come into contact and one is overemphasised at the expense of the other. A vertical focus tends to emphasise 'the cosmic world,' directing its attention toward a sense of the presence and activity of God existing above and beyond the fallen world of humankind. 'The Liturgy' viewed according to this perspective is 'otherworldly', a means of providing access to an: '...extra dimension of divine presence and power that profane or secular life seems to lack.'<sup>31</sup> The liturgical year in this perspective is largely disconnected from the experience of real-time with its link to actual places where these vary from the temperate Northern hemispheric seasonal norm<sup>32</sup> (out of which the liturgy emerged historically),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> GIRM (2007) §11, p.4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> This understanding comes from the thought of Karl Rahner who highlighted the vertical dimension and the horizontal dimension of human experience in: 'The Church's Commission to Bring Salvation and the Humanization of the World', *Theological Investigations 14: Ecclesiology, Questions of the Church, the Church in the World*, trans. David Bourke (New York: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1976), 295-313.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Michael Horace Barnes, 'On Finding God in All Things,' in *A Sacramental Life: A Festschrift Honoring Bernard Cooke*, eds. William P. Roberts, Michael Horace Barnes and Bernard Cooke (Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2003), 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> For example, while the initial celebrations of Easter and Christmas developed in and were influenced by the environmental and climatic conditions in the temperate parts of the Northern hemisphere (i.e., Easter in spring, Christmas in winter), in other parts of the world where these feasts continue to be celebrated today, the environmental and climatic conditions differ considerably from those of the temperate North. In Australia, Easter is celebrated in Autumn, the experience of which differs depending on where one is located on the continent: in the south-east and south-west typically it is cool and rainy, while in the centre it is dry and moderate, and in the tropical north the climate is heading into the Dry or Winter season (May – October). In contrast Christmas in Australia is celebrated in Summer, which means the climate is hot and dry for most of the continent, but Wet and potentially cyclonic in the tropical north (November – April).

and is a pristine supra-natural entity that is understood to operate and be interpreted in exactly the same way regardless of whatever is happening in the physical location in which it is celebrated. The notion of preserving 'the Liturgy' from contamination by the profane or secular world of human culture and nature<sup>33</sup> is consistent with an overemphasis on this vertical theological focus.

On the other hand, a horizontal focus tends to emphasise the human social world and the experience of God and God's grace mediated via nature, history and human cultures. The notion of liturgical inculturation, or engaging the liturgy and human cultures in a mutual dialogue that 'respects and fosters the genius and talents of the various races and peoples' and even at times, permits admission into the liturgy itself, of elements of peoples' cultures 'that are not indissolubly bound up with superstition and error, 34 is consistent with this horizontal theological focus. 'The liturgy' in this perspective is the outward human ritual expression of a sacred reality celebrated within the limitations of time and place, born of human cultures as a 'this-worldly' vehicle via which the divine and human interact in the here and now. Taken to an extreme, the liturgical year in this perspective is so strongly connected with the experience of real-time in specific places that Easter cannot be celebrated in any season other than spring-time, 35 which for southern-Australians (and others in the Southern hemisphere who experience an identifiable spring season) would mean the celebration of Easter in September rather than April, and would entail the loss of a unified universal anniversary of Easter worldwide.

Radical forms of either a vertical or a horizontal focus tend to underplay the value of their opposite counterpart. Ideally, both the vertical and horizontal perspectives on the presence of God operative in and through human liturgical celebration will be balanced in a way that understands the limitations of human ritual expression born of and adapted according to the various cultural and environmental locations of humankind, but that also recognizes realistically,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Michael Horace Barnes explains that this view is born of a form of theological attitude that insists '...that ordinary secular reality is indeed secular, profane, and ordinarily at least not the locale for discovering the power of God's grace. Another form is a deep pessimism about modern society. A third form, sometimes derived from the first two, is the search for a highly particularist interpretation of Christianity which segregates Christianity from the world.' 'On Finding God in All Things,' 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Catholic Church, The Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, in *The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource*, Vol. 1, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. (Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications, 2004), §37, p. 11.

<sup>35</sup> Historically it was the Northern spring-time when Jesus died and rose from the dead.

that the vertical can only be found mediated via the horizontal.<sup>36</sup> Attempting to sever 'the Liturgy' from contact with the real-world of human existence is to overlook an opportunity to marry the vertical with the horizontal more closely in liturgical expression and interpretation, recognising more clearly the activity of God, the eternal grace of God, operative in the world of human existence in all of its diversity, here and now.

Having explored several understandings of time (real-time, natural-time, and liturgical-time), now we turn to a further consideration of 'place,' the other irreducible polarity in the time-place nexus, and the manner in which it influences our experience and conceptions of time, in order to comprehend why its influence must be taken into account whenever we conceive of liturgical time.

#### Time experienced in place 3.

It is clear that human experience and understanding of time (real-time and natural-time) is fundamentally linked with place. When considering liturgicaltime, it must be understood that because our temporal existence is necessarily emplaced, we can only celebrate liturgical-time in actual places. Given that the places of our existence vary considerably throughout the world, it follows that the way in which we experience time (real, natural and liturgical) will differ on account of the influence of the diverse physical environments constituting those places.

Place forms, shapes and provides many of the analogical categories via which we experience the world. It is one undeniably common denominator among the various peoples making up a particular culture, and is fundamentally constitutive at both conscious and unconscious levels of many of the unique aspects of a people's way of life in a particular locale. Eugene V. Walter explains:

A place has no feelings apart from human experience there. But a place is a location of experience. It evokes and organizes memories, images, feelings, sentiments, meanings, and the work of imagination. The feelings of a place are indeed the mental projections of individuals, but they come from collective experience and they do not happen anywhere else. They belong to the place.<sup>37</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> See Barnes, 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Eugene V. Walter, *Placeways: A Theory of the Human Environment* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1988), 21.

Place teaches us what to expect, provides the sensory input via which and over against which we conceive the world and imagine ourselves in it, creating categories within which our religious imaginations operate. Humans experience places via our senses, but do far more than simply take in what our senses perceive about those places: humans interpret places, make inferences about them, dream about them, judge them, imagine them, <sup>38</sup> and seek to shape them, come to knowledge of them and become attached to them because of the experiences we undergo in them. All of these interactions in 'place' generate forms of knowledge that 'permit the individual to accumulate a past, think on the present, and anticipate the future.'<sup>39</sup>

The mutual experience of the formative power of a native environment is one of the factors contributing strongly to a corporate sense of identity recognized and reinforced by those who live in that environment. Environmental psychologist W.H. Ittleson explains that: 'Individuals as members of broad social groups, are socialized not just to behave, but to behave appropriately in relation to relevant physical settings; and not simply to the immediate sensory stimuli of the setting, but to its symbolic qualities as well - the 'meanings' suggested by outward appearances,'40 which, I suggest, would include the social experience of time in those physical settings. Environmental psychologists consider that the spatio-physical characteristics of the environment function in supraindividual way on the members of a given community in a given locale. 41 Places shape and define more or less strongly, attitudes, values, beliefs and affective responses relating to environmental conditions, as the people living in those places develop diverse forms of adjustment and adaptation to those conditions over and in time. 42 The environments in which we live affect every aspect of our lives from dress to behaviour to language to food to physical characteristics to imagination and conceptions of time. The environments in which we live nurture us and kill us; nourish us and starve us; burn us and drown us; desiccate us and freeze us. One's own personal psychological history is as shaped by the places in which one has lived as any other factor, interaction, experience or lesson in life.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> W.H. Ittleson, H. Proshansky, A. Rivlin and G. Winkel, *An Introduction to Environmental Psychology* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1974), 85.
<sup>39</sup> *Ihid*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*, 90-91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> See Mirilia Bonnes and Gianfranco Secchiaroli, *Environmental Psychology: A Psycho-Social Introduction*, trans. Claire Montagna (London: Sage Publications, 1995), 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> J.F. Wohlwill, The emerging discipline of environmental psychology, *American Psychologist* 25/4 (1970): 304.

When we come to celebrate the presence of God in human experience, we cannot underestimate the influence of place on that human experience or its celebration. Nor can we underestimate the importance of apprehending God's presence in and through every imaginable place in God's creation, not just those that happen to have influenced the ancient writers of portions of the prayers we pray in the contemporary 'universal' liturgy. Overlooking, undervaluing or ignoring the 'place' realities which determine our localized experience of real-time when we come to consider how to celebrate liturgical time, risks neglecting one half of the place-time nexus in which we live.

Liturgy is always celebrated in a particular place/environment, which means that liturgical time is experienced differently depending on where we celebrate it. A sense of dislocation can be felt when people from places other than the Northern temperate seasonal norm celebrate a liturgy that has been generated from within that environmental norm and imbued with a hermeneutic tradition and operative environmental-psychology engendered by that norm. When Southern and equatorial Christians attempt to celebrate the liturgical year utilizing prayers that retain vestiges of their Northern hemispheric roots, we can experience a sense of temporal displacement because our inverted real-world and real-time emplaced experience can be directly opposite to (or at least substantially different from) many of the predominant natural-season-based metaphors and analogies contained in the Northern-generated 'universal' liturgy. There is often something awkward about the 'fit' of these Northern prayers when employed in their new Southern locations.

# 4. The incongruity generated by temporal displacement in the Liturgy

A key hermeneutic undergirding the history, theology and catechesis of the liturgical year (understood as part of an uninterrupted apostolic tradition)<sup>43</sup> is that of the Northern temporal-seasonal experience, vestiges of which remain in the 'universal' liturgy.<sup>44</sup> One of the strongest and most prevalent metaphors utilized in the universal liturgical prayer texts at Christmas and Epiphany is that of 'Christ the light of the world', 'Christ the light of the nations'<sup>45</sup> coming to conquer the darkness and draw us into his wonderful light. The blessing at the end of Mass for The Nativity of the Lord<sup>46</sup> reads:

46 *Ibid.*, p. 104.

<sup>43</sup> VL §26.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Other Northern seasonal vestiges can be found in the present liturgical prayers of Easter, which also assume a Northern natural-season-based hermeneutic tradition of theology and catechesis. For more information on this see my article: 'Inculturating the Easter Feast in Southeast Australia,' *Worship* 78/2 (March 2004): 98-117.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Missale Romanum editia typica tertia, promulgated by John Paul II, Ordo Missae II, Grey Book (Vatican City: Vatican Press, 2007), p. 18.

May the God of infinite goodness, who by the Incarnation of his Son has driven darkness from the earth and by his Son's glorious Birth has illuminated this most holy night (day), drive far from you the darkness of vice and illumine your hearts with the light of virtue. *R. Amen* 

The blessing at the end of Mass for The Epiphany of the Lord (subtitled 'Christ the light of the nations')<sup>47</sup> reads:

May God, who has called you out of darkness into his wonderful light, kindly pour out his blessing upon you and make your heats firm in faith, hope and charity. *R. Amen* 

And because you confidently follow Christ, who today appeared in the world as a light shining in darkness, May God make you also a light for your brothers and sisters. R. Amen

When your pilgrimage is ended, may you come to him, whom the Magi sought as they followed the star and found with great joy, the Light from Light, who is Christ the Lord. R. Amen

A difficulty encountered by Christians in the temperate Southern hemisphere is that when we celebrate the universal feasts of Christmas and Epiphany, we do so in the season of summer (or the Wet-season in the tropics). The environmental-seasonal context shaping our consonant temporal real-world experience is one in which there is an abundance of light, warmth and heat from the sun, which is at its strongest and most fierce at this time of year, and given that our days are at their longest (and can be even longer with the additional hour gained by daylight savings), the invocation of a light-based metaphor to remind us of the magnitude of the event of the incarnation, does not carry the same effective level of power it wields in the context of the temperate Northern winter. The sense of temporal displacement intuited by many Southerners in the context of liturgical celebration at Christmas, exacerbated by the presence of seasonally inappropriate Northern metaphors, is compounded when the theological hermeneutic history associated with the feast of Christmas is understood.

**4.1** Presence of a dominant Northern seasonal theological hermeneutic When studying the complicated and somewhat opaque origins of the Christian feast of Christmas, two dominant hypotheses to explain its evolution are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 105.

encountered: the History-of-Religions hypothesis<sup>48</sup> and the Calculation hypothesis.<sup>49</sup> The debates over the origin of Christmas are well-rehearsed, and cannot be engaged anew here, but what is undeniable in the historical evidence utilized in both hypotheses is, as Susan K. Roll writes, a '...persistence of the theme of light and sun, which, if insufficient to draw solid conclusions as to the feast's origins, points to a thematic undertow in its celebration in the Northern hemisphere.'<sup>50</sup> Roll refers to the employment of analogies of Christ with light and sun in the Christmas homilies of Leo the Great (+461) repudiating the 'darkness' of one or another non-Christian religion or heterodox Christian group. <sup>51</sup> She writes:

<sup>50</sup> Susan K. Roll, The Origins of Christmas: The State of the Question, *Between Memory and Hope: Readings on the Liturgical Year*, ed. Maxwell E. Johnson (Collegeville: The Liturgical Press, 2000), 289.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> The History-of-Religions hypothesis promoted initially by Bernard Botte in *Les origins de la Noël et de lÉpiphanie*, Textes et Études liturgiques 1 (Louvain: Mont César/Keizersberg Abbey, 1932) holds that 4<sup>th</sup> century Roman Christians reinterpreted the pagan feast of the *dies natalis Solis Invicti* to give it a Christian meaning. The birthday of the unconquerable sun occurred at the Northern winter solstice when the sun is at its weakest and the days are at their shortest, and having been re-born (as it were), the unconquerable sun grows in intensity again as the spring and summer approach. Christians began to emphasise the understanding that Christ is the unconquerable sun, and from the 4<sup>th</sup> century on it became standard for Christians to turn to the east to pray (in the direction from where the sun rises). Celebrating the birthday of Christ the true sun on the same day as pagans were celebrating the birth of the sun in Rome made perfect sense. See Josef A. Jungmann, *The Early Liturgy: To the Time of Gregory the Great* (Notre Dame IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1959/2000), 147-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> The Calculation hypothesis advanced largely by Louis Duchesne and advocated again in recent years by Thomas J. Talley in The Origins of the Liturgical Year (Collegeville: The Liturgical Press, 1990), holds that the four turning points of the natural climatic and cosmic year in the Northern hemisphere (vernal equinox, summer solstice, autumnal equinox, winter solstice) correspond directly with the conception and birthdates of Christ and John the Baptist (i.e., Jesus was conceived at the vernal equinox and born at the winter solstice, while John was conceived at the autumnal equinox and born at the summer solstice). Because Christ must have died on the same day as he was conceived (i.e., the vernal equinox, 25 March, the same day on which the world was created, in the Northernhemisphere season of spring), and given that as God he would have been perfect in every aspect of his life-span, he must have been born 9 months later on 25 December Augustine and other Patristics linked this calculation theory with scriptural evidence [John 3:30 where John the Baptist states 'He must increase, but I must decrease', Christ as Sun of Justice (Mal 4:2) and Christ as Light of the world (John 8:12)] and with what was happening to the sun in nature at those key points in the Northern seasonal year. See Jungmann 147. For a detailed study on the origins of the Christmas feast see: Susan K. Roll, Toward the Origins of Christmas (Kampen, The Netherlands: Kok Pharos, 1995).

<sup>51</sup> Ibid.

Leo, Ambrose, the Cappadocian fathers and other patristic preachers in effect co-opted the image of Christ as the new sun, which implies both the resurrection and the 'rebirth' of the sun at the winter solstice. The oldest extant liturgical texts for Christmas are found in the *Veronensis* and include nine sets of formularies which link the themes of light and the birth of Christ The opening prayer for Mass at midnight in the contemporary *Roman Missal*, based on the Gelasian Sacramentary, echoes the theme of Christ as light, and implicitly the 'true sun' of the world.<sup>52</sup>

Once the hermeneutic history underlying the imagery evoked in the prayers of the 'universal' liturgy at Christmas is understood, there is no denying the clear Northern-hemispheric natural seasonal links that persist in parts of those prayers. The opportunity to capitalise on the natural-world theological parallels is irresistible in the cold, dark, damp and often icy conditions of the Northernhemisphere at Christmas, when the promise of light and warmth are sought, and the invocation of traditional understandings of Christ the Light, Christ our Sun of Justice, etc., makes perfect sense. However, as Roll notes, 'The sharp clash between the traditional Christmas symbolism rooted in the cold dark Northern hemisphere and the totally opposite climatic conditions of late December in the Southern hemisphere, reflects a compelling credibility gap between practice and reality in the South.'53 While the 'light out of darkness' metaphor is alive and active in the seasonal-environmental experience of Northern Christians, in the seasonal-environmental experience of Southern and equatorial Christians this metaphor falters. The real time-place experience of Southern and equatorial Christians at Christmas can be entirely other than that of Northerners to the extent that Southern and equatorial Christians are forced into a solely vertical theological interpretation of the metaphor which, in effect, severs the real timeplace link almost entirely, whereas Northerners benefit from both a vertical and a horizontal theological interpretation of what is still a living, active and applicable metaphor according to the Northern experience of the time-place link.

Naturally, at one level, Southern and equatorial Christians can comprehend the historical fact of Jesus' death occurring at or around the Northern spring-time feast of Passover, and consequently (following the calculation hypothesis) can accept the historical tradition of his birth occurring at the Northern winter

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Susan K. Roll, Christmas: The Mirror Reflecting Us Back to Ourselves, in *Christian Feast and Festival: The Dynamics of Western Liturgy and Culture*, eds., P. Post, G. Rouwhorst, L. van Tongeren and A. Scheer (Leuven: Peeters, 2001), 528.

solstice. We can imagine ourselves into that context when we recall the historical events of his life, death and resurrection, despite the fact that we mark those events in seasonal-environmental contexts other than spring and winter. However, our ability to imagine ourselves retrally into the historical time-frame and seasonal-locale of the original Easter and Christmas events needs to be put into mutual, respectful dialogue with the concurrent place-time realities in which we live. Unfortunately the universal Church's current insistence on maintaining a Northern-season-based hermeneutic tradition (as part of the uninterrupted apostolic tradition) with regard to the major poles of the liturgical year (Easter and Christmas) and their pairing with the major Northern seasonal poles (vernal equinox and winter solstice), makes little room for this dialogue.

The suggestion that praying for a return of the light at Christmas can be interpreted by Australians celebrating Christmas in summer as an exultation of the light already present or as an opportunity to imagine entry into a further level of intensity/brightness of the light already apparent, is nonsensical<sup>54</sup> because the metaphor of light out of darkness only works as the contrast of opposites. The 'deliberate yoking of unlikes'<sup>55</sup> is what gives the metaphor its power. Two 'likes' do not make a potent metaphor. The confrontation of deliberately contrasted states and imagery that is discontinuous with one's experiential reality, can shock one out of localized complacency, and can excite new perceptions of current circumstances in light of their opposite numbers. This is what the 'light out of darkness' metaphor does in the Northern temperate seasonal context at Christmas. When utilized in the Southern summer

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> A.G. Martimort demonstrates this point in another context, noting that the celebration of the Easter Vigil had been begun earlier and earlier on Holy Saturday, so that by the 13th century: The ceremony now began at two in the afternoon, although the celebrants did wait for the first star to appear before beginning the Mass. Soon the blessing of the new fire was beginning at midday. There was now a contradiction between the spring sun that was filling the church with its light and the singing of the Exultet with its praise of a night truly blessed. The entire symbolism of the vigil had now been falsified. A.G. Martimort, I.E. Dalmais and P. Jounel, The Church at Prayer Vol IV: The Liturgy and Time, new ed., trans. Matthew J. O'Connell (Collegeville: The Liturgical Press, 1983/1986), 40. A falsification of symbol and a contradiction between what is actually happening seasonally in one placecontext and the embedded natural seasonal references in the universal prayers of the liturgy, is apparent when the universal prayers of the liturgy at Christmas rely on and emphasise the symbol of the light of Christ illuminating the darkness. In the Northern mid-winter context the natural seasonal lens of the increasing light of the coming spring is obvious. In the Southern mid-summer seasonal-context, the symbol of light out of darkness is falsified because of the real-life inverse seasonal reality contradicting the universal prayer texts and their traditional interpretations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Owen Barfield, *Poetic Diction: A Study in Meaning* (London: Faber and Gwye, 1928) quoted in Paul Ricoeur, *La Métaphore vive* (Paris: Seuil, 1975) 6<sup>th</sup> study, La Travail de la resemblance, 271.

seasonal context, the natural 'light out of darkness' metaphor is seriously weakened, losing its Northern contextual potency. What some Australians tend to do automatically or subconsciously is to excise from consideration the embedded seasonal-references in the prayer-texts, choosing to interpret the 'light out of darkness' metaphor purely in terms of light shining in the darkness of night-time or the light of virtue defeating the darkness of sin. This is sufficient for some, but it is not necessarily the intended emphasis of the 'universal' tradition of interpretation of this metaphor.

Ignoring or denying the possibility of alternate metaphors for comprehending the coming of Christ in environments other than the temperate Northern hemispheric norm assumed by the liturgical texts, diminishes the potency of the 'universal' liturgy in those other environments by restricting interpretation of the 'universal' metaphors to the purely vertical theological axis, rather than embracing operative local metaphors that may reflect potently the horizontal experience of God's presence in the real-time places of local celebration. It could be argued that the liturgy celebrated by Southerners is thus impoverished because we automatically excise the Northern-seasonal interpretations from the possible range of meanings available to us because they do not make sense in our place-time, and we have not been permitted to draw upon an alternate set of appropriate Southern-based natural-seasonal metaphors to take their place. The restriction of the possible range of interpretations of the metaphor of 'light out of darkness' for Southerners at Christmas on account of our place-time circumstances, contributes to our sense of dislocation from the 'universal' liturgy.

# 4.2 Are 'universal' notions of liturgical time part of the 'uninterrupted apostolic tradition'?

In reconsidering the quote from *Varietates Legitimae* with which this essay began in light of what has been explored above, it is clear that a question must be asked regarding the extent to which the 'uninterrupted apostolic tradition' must be adhered in the prayers and theological interpretations of today's 'universal' liturgy. The Vatican Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments (CDWDS) teaches that '...the prayers of the Roman Liturgy owe a great deal to the theology and expression of the Latin Fathers. Many of these, but especially Saints Ambrose, Augustine, Leo and Gregory left their imprints on local prayers which were eventually adopted for use in the modern Roman Rite.' This teaching is not problematic in itself, however, when it is viewed in relation to an official explanation of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments, *Ratio Translations for the English Language* (Vatican City: Vatican Press, 2007), §19, p. 16.

continuing and universal normativity of these prayers and their theological interpretation, offered by Cardinal Jorge Medina Estévez (former Prefect of the CDWDS), a different view of this teaching emerges. Cardinal Medina Estévez writes:

While many of the prayers of the Roman Rite are quite ancient, they have endured because they have within them a spiritual wealth which is perennial. Though composed in particular circumstances, they transcend the limits of their original situation to become the prayer of the Church in any place and in any age.... While liturgical prayer can and should be allowed to be *formed by* culture, one must never lose sight of the far more important fact that it must be *formative of* culture. Also, the work of translation should be deeply imbued with the realisation that prayer can come *from the heart* only after it has been *received* as a gift from God, through the mediation of the Church.<sup>57</sup>

There are several difficulties with this explanation which must be addressed. Firstly, it assumes that the theology and prayers of the Patristic Latin Fathers such as Augustine, Ambrose, Gregory and Leo, while 'composed in particular circumstances' are in fact a-cultural, and that they do 'transcend the limits of their original situation' to become the prayer of the Church 'in any place and any age.' This is certainly going to be true of the more generic or purely scripturally-based portions of these prayers, which are capable of being understood and applied universally. However, where they do allude to geographically or seasonally-specific metaphors for understanding the Paschal Mystery expressed through the course of the liturgical year, they cease to be acultural and become culture and place specific which means that in their use of seasonally-linked metaphors and theological interpretations they do not always transcend the limits of their original situation so that they can be celebrated meaningfully in any place and any age. Ignoring or overlooking the fact that even Ambrose, Augustine, Leo and Gregory could not help but be shaped by the environmental circumstances in which they existed, and that vestiges of their local-environmentally-shaped experience and worldview remain in their prayer legacy, evidences a somewhat narrow view of the reality out of which these ancient prayers emerged.

Secondly, Christian faith does not exist outside of a cultural context. Culture is a human construct that can only exist in time and in place, and Christian faith is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Cardinal Jorge Medina Estévez, On the ICEL Controversy, *America Magazine* (13 May 2000), online version, accessed 19 January 2009.

always experienced in and through local culture. H. Richard Niebuhr explains in *Christ and Culture* that:

Christ claims no man purely as a natural being, but always as one who has become human in culture; who is not only in culture, but into whom culture has penetrated. Man not only speaks but thinks with the aid of the language of culture. Not only has the natural world about him been modified by human achievement; but the forms and attitudes of his mind which allow him to make sense of the natural world have been given him by culture. <sup>58</sup>

We cannot speak comprehensively about a people's culture without acknowledging the influence on that culture of the physical environment in which it is located. Everything that people do, think and experience in a specific space-time locus contributes to their understanding it as 'place' rather than just as 'space.' Eugene V. Walter notes that: 'Human experience makes a place, but place locates experience in people.' One of the fundamental tenets of environmental psychology is that cognitive development occurs in context, which means taking seriously the impact of the local environment on the cognitive development of every person. People generate and mediate meaning via their sense experience which they can contact only within time, place and culture. A people's understandings of time cannot be separated from their understandings of place, which in turn cannot be separated from their cultural context (of which the physical environment is a constitutive and irreducible component).

To suggest that liturgical prayer generated in one cultural and temporalseasonal context *must be formative of* the culture of a people emplaced in a cultural and temporal-seasonal context that is, at times, its exact opposite, evidences a serious misunderstanding or a discounting of the time-place nexus in which every culture exists. It also evidences a misapprehension of the impact of place on the development of a people and their culture in that place, as well

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> H. Richard Niebuhr, *Christ and Culture* (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1951), 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Walter, 131.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> See Roger M. Downs and Lynn S. Liben, 'Mediating the Environment: Communicating, Appropriating and Developing Graphic Representations of Place,' in *Development in Context: Acting and Thinking in Specific Environments*, eds. Robert H. Wozniak and Kurt W. Fischer (Hillsdale NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum, 1993), 173.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Ittleson *et al* note that '...there is no physical environment that is not embedded in and inextricably related to a social system. We cannot respond to an environment independently of our role as social beings. Even a solitary person reacts to his setting on the basis of his isolation. The nature of an environment will affect the functioning of groups whether this environment be a city or a school room.' *An Introduction to Environmental Psychology*, 12.

as an imperialistic view of the universal applicability of the typical editions of the liturgy. The reality of lived human existence in time and in place, cannot be homogenized and cannot be dissevered from the actual experience of real people conducting real celebrations of the liturgy in myriad variation throughout the world. The simple reality is that the locations in which people celebrate the liturgy inevitably will affect the manner in which they receive, interpret and make sense of the liturgy and liturgical time in their local context.

To impose the regional expression of a dominant culture *on* another culture, is to mystify and dislocate the people of that second culture, to alienate them from how they recognise the truth of Christ's presence in their midst, and to ask them to imagine themselves primarily within categories that are foreign to their present experienced, emplaced reality.

For those who have celebrated the universal liturgy in the Northern climes from which it originated, re-experiencing it in the South can highlight just how little has been done to help the liturgy to take root in Australia, and just how much simultaneous translation is involved in re-interpreting the liturgy so that it can make sense in our context. It becomes apparent that significant parts of the tradition are unavailable to us because they do not make sense in our context. There is a whole other layer of interpretation available to Christians celebrating the liturgy in the temperate North, because the liturgical year reflects what is happening there naturally, environmentally, seasonally. When there has been no attempt made to inculturate the liturgy in terms of the natural-environmental-seasonal context of the South, intuiting a sense of temporal dislocation between liturgical time and real-time is not surprising.

# 5. The case for inculturation of traditional understandings of liturgical time

If our time-place conceptual linkage and our understanding of time marked according to the categories of nature is a logical construct born of sense experience, it follows then, that the religious imaginations out of which we operate to help us to find and access meaning in the time-places of our existence, are calibrated differently depending on where we live and experience time-in-place. To conceive of liturgical time as something separate from the lived experience of time-in-place is a false dichotomy. Our notions of liturgical time cannot be separated from 'place' if the liturgy is to be celebrated authentically and fully by each particular people, in their particular 'here and now'.

In *Varietates Legitimae*, the CDWDS highlighted the challenge of balancing the universal aspects of the liturgy with its local particularity of expression, noting that:

...the liturgy of the Church must not be foreign to any country, people or individual, and at the same time it should transcend the particularity of race or nation. It must be capable of expressing itself in every human culture, all the while maintaining its identity through fidelity to the tradition which comes to it from the Lord. 62

The process of coming to terms with the diversity of the contemporary universal Church involves acknowledgment of the fact that not everyone experiences place-time in the same way. The process of developing a truly universal liturgy could involve excising the last vestiges of Northern-seasonal references from the editiones typicae prayer texts. This could mitigate the cognitive dissonances that can occur when a falsification of symbol is necessitated by the discordant collision of traditional season-based symbols and the (at times) totally opposite lived reality of the people celebrating the liturgy in places other than the temperate North. Alternatively, allowing the universal liturgy to be adapted modestly via the process of liturgical inculturation at the local-church level so that the Northern-seasonal-linked metaphors are replaced by ones that 'work' in the local contexts of the South, is a notion worthy of strong consideration. It is well within the realm of official Church teaching on the liturgy to suggest that there may indeed be a need for and a legitimate way in which to adapt the official liturgy and its celebration through the liturgical year to the unique needs and circumstances of Australian Catholic-Christians. The first step in this process involves recognising that we do indeed have unique needs and circumstances that are determined largely by the unique timeplaces and varied environmental-seasonal contexts of our existence. Inculturation of liturgical time entails allowing into the prayers of the liturgy, alternative real-time, natural-time metaphors that reflect a local experience of time-in-place, instead of continuing to regard as universally normative (and hence universally meaningful), the Northern-season-based liturgical timemetaphors currently embedded in the liturgy. The next step in this investigation (which cannot be attempted here) would be to discover which local symbols may house the potential to express the character of the liturgical year in terms appropriate to and reflective of the presence of God operative and celebrated in the reality of our own environmental place-times.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> VL §18.

Downplaying or ignoring the influence of the local physical environment on our conceptions of real-time, natural-time and liturgical time, risks overemphasising the vertical theological focus to the disadvantage of the horizontal, encouraging an 'other-worldly' perspective to dominate the liturgy to the detriment of a 'this-worldly' perspective. The incarnation brought the two into direct and essential relationship: the divine interacting with the human to redeem and sanctify the world of our actual existence. While we await the final coming of the kingdom, our liturgies of praise and thanksgiving, celebrated in the here and now, in hope of and belief in that which is to come, remind us of the paradox of the assurance of our salvation already achieved, and that we still await its coming. Our liturgies ideally will embody and balance both horizontal and vertical theological interpretations because both are essential if we are to enter into and contemplate fully the paradox of the incarnation and our salvation. Taking seriously the influence of 'place' on shaping local understandings of real-time, natural-time and liturgical-time in cultural context, is essential if the vertical and horizontal theological axes are to be re-balanced and if the univocal, largely Northern-based manner in which the Church universal currently conceives of liturgical time is to be grounded in the reality of place.

# A set of Prayers of Invocation for the major seasons of the Church Year, incorporating South East Australian climate imagery.

### Nathan Nettleton<sup>1</sup>

### Advent

Blessed are you, God of all creation, and blessed is the communion into which you gather us.

Your Word is conceived within us, and we grow heavy with hope, eagerly awaiting the day when all creation will be delivered into your glorious freedom.

Send your Holy Spirit to call us by name and lead us home.

The prophets crying in the wilderness awaken us with their holy anger and passionate hope. Come, Lord Jesus, bring the day of justice to birth.

Send your Holy Spirit....

As the shadows shrink and the sun begins to bite, we anticipate your coming with joy and fear. Come, Lord Jesus, give us the courage to yield to the purifying fire of your love, raging towards us.

Send your Holy Spirit....

#### Christmas

Blessed are you, God of all creation, and blessed is the holy child of Bethlehem, the Word made flesh in our midst

You come to us in everything you have created, in seas and stars, in river and rock; But tonight we celebrate the gift of yourself given to us in a fragile baby;

Over the past decade, Nathan Nettleton's congregation, the South Yarra Community Baptist Church, has sought to weave the ancient traditions of Christian liturgy with the vitality of contemporary Australian experience to create a powerful and intimate experience of worship. Their on-line ministry at Laughingbird.net makes some of their resources available to the wider church.

gurgling, crying, laid in a manger, sharer of our flesh and blood.

O come, let us adore him;

O come, let us adore him;

O come, let us adore him;

Christ the Lord.

Send your Holy Spirit among us, that we might follow the star of your hope, reflect the bright beams of your grace and truth, and offer our gifts wherever we find your Son.

O come, let us adore him...

Shine your light on us like the blazing sun, withering all that is trivial and false, forcing our roots deeper into your mercy, and driving us to seek rest and replenishment in the cool oceans of Christ's love.

O come, let us adore him...

### Lent

Blessed are you, God of all creation, and blessed is the communion into which you gather us.

Dry seeds of hope thirst for life-giving rain; Hard heartlands yearn for a softening shower; The dust and smoke of the parched earth rise up with the prayers of your people:

Send your Holy Spirit to call us by name and lead us home.

Wearied by the heat of hostility, your Son beats back the fires of hell, and calls us to follow him on the road to life; on through the charred valley of despair.

Send your Holy Spirit...

Days shorten and clouds darken the horizon; Bleached skeleton trees warn of unspeakable death, and the crows keep a knowing eye on our journey.

Send your Holy Spirit...

#### Pascha

Blessed are you, God of all creation, and blessed is the communion into which you gather us.

The vacant cross and the empty tomb vindicate your claim that the love which suffers is the love which saves.

Send your Holy Spirit to call us by name and lead us home.

Life rises anew from the parched earth as the heat relents and the rains return.

The thought of a raging fire loses its fear and promises instead a place of warmth and rest

Send your Holy Spirit to call us by name and lead us home.

You meet us on the road with hands still holed but breath warm and conversation engaging. And though you go on ahead you promise a companion to show us the way.

Send your Holy Spirit...

#### Pentecost

Blessed are you, God of all creation, and blessed is the communion into which you gather us.

Your Son called us to continue his mission and promised not to leave us alone, but to send us a partner with wisdom and power.

Send your Holy Spirit to call us by name and lead us home.

We look to you with eager expectation, for you have promised gifts unimaginable and opened us to the delight and wonder of life.

# Send your Holy Spirit...

Like a blazing fire, melt the stubborn grip of fear. Like a wild wind, dispel the dust of complacency. Like a kookaburra's call, pierce pride with joy.

Send your Holy Spirit...

# The practice of singing chant in the Catholic archdiocese of Melbourne

### **Paul Taylor**

### Introduction

The practice of singing chant in the Catholic Church has undergone dramatic changes since the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965). Prior to the conciliar reforms of the 1960s, plainchant was the official music for the Latin liturgical texts in the Roman Catholic Mass and Divine Office prayed by priests and religious and, to a lesser extent laity, around the world. The Council's first major document, the *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* (1963), called for the preservation of the Church's tradition of using Latin and chant in the liturgy. At the same time, however, it authorized the extended use of vernacular and modern compositions in an effort to promote the full, conscious and active participation of the people in the liturgy. The effect of the Council on liturgical music in Australia and other countries was profound. The Council's reforms paved the way for the flourishing of liturgical song in English. The door was opened to a range of musical styles and instruments including popular style liturgical songs, guitar accompaniments and cantors and 'lead singers' of the congregation.<sup>2</sup>

Forty-five years after the Council, it is now not uncommon for the singing of Catholic priests and congregations in Australia to be characterized by the use of popular hymns such as *Here I am Lord* (1981), *Gather Us In* (1982) and Mass settings such as *Mass of Creation* (1984). Whilst some music from the Catholic Church's collective memory such as *All Creatures of our God and King* and *Hail, Queen of Heaven* have been retained, other items such as the plainchant *Missa de Angelis* and traditional motet *Adoro te* have been generally abandoned since the introduction of the English Order of Mass (1969). However, chant has not entirely disappeared from Catholic liturgical practice in Australia and is still employed during certain parts of the Mass and highpoints of the liturgical year.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Second Vatican Council, *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* (1963) art. 14, 36 and 54 in *The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource*, Vol. 1, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. (2004) 6, 11 and 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy (1963) arts. 118, 120 and General Instruction of the Roman Missal (2002) 102 in The Liturgy Documents (2004) 26, 59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The top 100 liturgical songs listed on the Word of Life International Copyright website provides an indicative listing of contemporary copyrighted items that are used. See <a href="http://www.freelink.com.au/top100.htm">http://www.freelink.com.au/top100.htm</a> (last accessed 15 March 2009).

In light of the Council's vision for both the preservation of chant and the development of modern compositions, the following discussion will focus on the practices of singing chant that been discerned in one particular community, namely, the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne. Not only is this diocese the largest in Australia, it has been at the forefront of liturgical renewal during the past fifty years. The Diocesan Liturgical Commission in Melbourne, for example, organised conventions for priests, religious and laity in 1955 and 1961. Later, in April 1993, a National Liturgical Music Convention organised by Michael and Jane Wood was held in Melbourne and attracted 15,000 people. In terms of publications, various hymnals used around Australia, such as *The Australian Hymnal, The Hymnal of St Pius X*, the *Catholic Worship Book* and *Gather Australia* were compiled in Melbourne.

The trends discussed are based on a recent survey entitled *The Ministerial and Congregational Singing of Chant: A Study of Practice in Parishes of the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne* (hereafter chant survey) that was used to generate data for my PhD research project at Australian Catholic University in Melbourne. The chant survey contained sixteen questions and was distributed via mail to all 226 diocesan parishes from which 137 responses were received, a return rate of 61%. The fifteen questions are as follows:

- 1. Which of the ministerial chants in the Sacramentary are normally sung by the presiding celebrant in dialogue with the congregation at one or more of your Sunday Masses (including the Vigil)?
- 2. Which hymn books are used by musicians to accompany the parts of the Mass?
- 3. Which chant-based settings of liturgical texts are normally sung during the year in your parish?
- 4. Which chant-based hymns are sung during the year?
- 5. Which chant-based Mass-settings are used in your parish?
- 6. Is there any other music sung in Latin by the choir, singers or congregation?
- 7. If yes, please list
- 8. Which Mass-settings in English are used in your parish?
- 9. Which music groups serve in your parish (eg mixed voice choir, music group, ethnic choir, cantors/leaders of song) and which of these groups used chant based settings of liturgical texts?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See Percy Jones (ed.), *The Australian Hymnal* (Melbourne: Advocate Press, 1942), *The Hymnal of St Pius X* (Melbourne: Allans Music, 1952, 1966), William Jordan (ed.), *Catholic Worship Book* (Sydney: E. J. Dwyer & London: Collins Liturgical, 1985) and Jane Wood (ed.), *Gather Australia* (Chicago: GIA & Melbourne: NLMC, 1995).

- 10. In which parts of the church are your musicians normally located (eg front, transept, gallery)?
- 11. Which instruments are normally used to accompany singing in your parish (organ, electronic keyboard, guitar)?
- 12. Which formats are used for congregations to see the texts of liturgical songs in your parish (eg Powerpoint, bulletin, hymn book)?
- 13. In what languages are Masses normally celebrated in your parish?
- 14. In general, who is responsible for deciding what will be sung in your parish? Please also indicate their educational qualifications in ministry, theology or music.
- 15. What is the approximate annual budget for liturgical music in your parish?

[article continues...]

The number of participants who completed the chant survey and their role within the parish are identified in the following table:

Chant Survey:	Number of
Participant's Role	Participants
Parish Priest	74
PP and Musician	1
PP and Director of Music	1
Pastoral Associate [PA]	14
PA and Musician	6
PA and Choir Leader	1
PA and Parish Secretary	1
Musician	15
Director of Music	8
Music Coordinator	1
Music Coordinator and PA	2
Choir Leader/Director	4
Organist	1
REC/Deputy Principal	1
Liturgy Team Member	1
Chair of Parish Council	1
Missing Identifications	5

Figure 1: Chant Survey - Role and Number of Participants

In this article, the discussion of singing chant in Melbourne's Catholic parishes will focus on the ministerial and congregational chant in English. Due to the constraints of space, the singing of chant in Latin and other languages such as Italian and Vietnamese will not be discussed as the chant survey indicated that English is the most common language of liturgical celebration across the diocese. It should be noted, however, that there is a custom of singing chant in Latin at both St Patrick's Cathedral, St Francis' Church, Lonsdale Street, and a small number of suburban parishes with trained choirs that also seek to preserve the Church's musical traditions. Ecclesial communities that celebrate the pre-Conciliar Tridentine Mass have also retained chant because of its integral part of the rite. Each of these groups, in different ways, seek to preserve the Church's distinguished tradition of Church music, particularly sacred chant and polyphonic compositions by recognized European masters such as Palestrina (c. 1525-1594) and Vittoria (1548-1611). Apart from the question of which chants are sung, the discussion will also analyse when chant is sung, and by whom, during the Church's liturgical celebrations and seasons.

#### Ministerial Chant in English

The ministerial chants printed in the English language Roman Missal/Sacramentary (1975) were compiled by a music committee of the International Commission on English in the Liturgy and are in many cased adapted from the original Latin chants printed in the *Missale Romanum* (1970). Ministerial chants with accompanying rubrics in red are included for virtually all of the Mass texts prayed aloud by the priest in dialogue with the congregation, extending from the opening Sign of the Cross and Greeting to the Gospel reading, the Eucharistic Prayer, the Prayer after Communion and the Blessing and Dismissal. To measure the practice of singing ministerial chants in the Archdiocese of Melbourne, participants in the chant survey were asked to indicate which ministerial chants in the Sacramentary are normally sung by the Presiding Celebrant in dialogue with the congregation at one or more Masses on Sunday, including the Vigil Mass. The results are presented in the following table.

Ministerial Chants between	% of Parishes that sing
Priest and People	Ministerial Chants
Introduction/Conclusion to Gospel:	8.0
Priest/Deacon: This is the Gospel of the	
Lord	
People: Praise to you, Lord Jesus Christ	
Preface Dialogue:	15.3
Priest Celebrant: The Lord be with you	
People: And also with you	
Memorial Acclamation invitation:	51.1
Let us proclaim the mystery of faith.	
Memorial Acclamation:	69.3
eg Christ has died	
Doxology: Through him, with him, in him.	57.7
Great Amen	69.3
Invitation to Lord's Prayer:	24.1
Let us pray with confidence	
The Lord's Prayer	35.0
Doxology:	22.6
For the kingdom, the power and the glory	
Others: eg	12.4
Embolism, Prayer for Peace, Collect Prayers	

Figure 2: Ministerial Chants Sung During Sunday Mass

The results in Figure 2 show that a significant majority of parishes sing the Memorial Acclamation (and invitation) and Lord's Prayer (with invitation). There is no way of telling whether the parishes who indicated they sing these ministerial chants use the chant or a non-chant version as musical versions of the chant were not included in the questionnaire. It would therefore be reasonable to assume that some parishes use the Sacramentary chants whilst others use versions of the ministerial chants contained in post-conciliar Mass settings such as the Mass of Creation (1984) by Marty Haugen as results from to the questionnaire indicated this was the most popular Mass setting used in the Archdiocese. It would seem, however, that the difference between the singing of the invitation and the singing of the acclamation implies there are parishes in which a sung acclamation by the people follows a spoken invitation by the minister, particularly the Eucharistic Acclamations and the Lord's Prayer. Unlike the other ministerial chants used during Mass, the chants printed in bold are at times sung as acclamations during an otherwise spoken Eucharistic Prayer, a practice that has also been observed in relation to the singing of ministerial chants in North America. Some scholars of liturgical music such as Michael Joneas have suggested the practice of inserting sung acclamations into otherwise spoken prayer texts can sometimes create the impression that music is an 'optional extra to be added to the liturgical texts on the basis of solemnity and taste rather than the lyrical means by which the texts are ritually performed.'5

One can observe a similar trend in relation to the Lord's Prayer which is sung by 35% or parishes, whilst only 24% sing the introduction beforehand and 22.6% sing the doxology afterwards. The syllabic arrangement by Melbourne's prominent Catholic priest, Cathedral choir director and Melbourne University lecturer, Rev. Dr Percy Jones (1914-1992) is adapted from the Sunday prayer tone A<sup>6</sup> and has been published widely in Australia since its first release in 1965, a factor which may account for why it appears to be well known. Whilst the chant melody of the Lord's Prayer in English has remained the same in Australia for over forty years, the melody of the Doxology that follows beginning with the words For the kingdom, the power and the glory . . . 'has changed. The version of this chant in the Sacramentary (1975) is slightly

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Jan Michael Joncas, 'The Assembly's Ownership of the Eucharistic Prayer: Why and How' in Michael R. Prendergast (ed.), *Full, Conscious and Active Participation: Celebrating Twenty-Five Years of Today's Liturgy* (Portland, OR: Pastoral Press, 2003) 208-216.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Graduale Triplex (Sablé-sur-Sarthe: Solesmes, 1979) 812.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See, eg, *The Living Parish Hymn Book* (Sydney: Living Parish Series, 1968) 163; *Parish Mass Book* (Melbourne: Advocate Press, 1970) 27; *Catholic Worship Book* (1985) 524; *The New Living Parish Hymn Book* (Sydney: E. J. Dwyer, 1987); *Gather Australia* (1995) 7.

different from the first version introduced in Australia in 1970.<sup>8</sup> It has been observed that the melodic differences have created confusion for priests and musicians.<sup>9</sup> This confusion may, in turn, account for why fewer parishes appear to sing this melody in comparison with the Lord's Prayer.

Of the ministerial chants listed in Figure 1, the least commonly sung chant is the Introduction/Conclusion to the Gospel which is sung in only 8.0% or 11 parishes. The parishes where these chants are sung are listed below (Figure 3). The adjoining columns indicate the other ministerial chants that are also sung, and other features such as the presence of a choir or cantor, an indication of who decides what is sung and the annual budget range for liturgical music.

	Survey No.	Intro & Concl to Gospel	Preface Dialogue	Intro to Lord's Prayer	Lord's Prayer	Doxology
Α	6	Y			Y	
В	9	Y		Y	Y	Y
С	10	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
D	29	Y				
Е	35	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
F	41	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
G	52	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Н	108	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
I	115	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
J	119	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
K	125	Y	Y	Y	Y	

	Others	Mixed	Cantor Serves	Who decides	Budget
		Voice	In parish	what is sung?	range in \$
		Choir			·
A				LTM, MC	500-1000
В				P, MC, O, LS	500-1000
С	Y eg. Collect	Y	Y	P, MC	10,000
	Prayer Over				or more
1	Gifts,				
1	Post-Comm		'		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Parish Mass Book (Melbourne: Advocate Press, 1970).

(Feb-Mar 1994) 67-69.

9 William Jordan, 'The Ministerial Chants: A View From Australia' in *Pastoral Music* 18:3

	Others	Mixed	Cantor Serves	Who decides	Budget
		Voice	In parish	what is sung?	range in \$
		Choir			
D			Y	P, LS	500-1000
Е	Y eg.			P, CM	2000-3000
	Embolism				
F				MC, O	Up to 500
G	Y eg.	Y		P, GL	500-1000
	Penitential		:		
	Rite				
Н	Y eg. Prayer			P, O	Up to 500
	for Peace				
I	Y eg. Proper	Y		P, LS	3000-5000
	Eucharistic				
	prayer, rite of				
	peace				
J	Y eg.	Y	Y	P	10,000
	Intro and				or more
	Concl Rites,				
	Presidential				
	prayers,				
	Rite of peace				
K			Y	P, O LS	500-1000

Figure 3: Some Characteristics of Parishes that Sing the Most Ministerial Chants Abbreviation Key:

Y = Yes, CM = Choir Master, GL = Group Leader, LTM = Liturgy Team Member, LS = Leader of Song, MC = Music Coordinator, O = Organist, P = Priest

The data in Figure 3 above suggests that in those parishes where the Introduction and Conclusion to the Gospel is sung, it generally follows that several of the other ministerial chants during the Eucharistic Prayer and Communion Rite are also sung, including some ministerial chants not listed in the survey question, such as the Presidential Prayers in the Introductory and Concluding Rite and the Rite of Peace before Communion. It appears that the singing of ministerial chants is influenced not so much by the presence of musical ministries of cantor or choir, or the budget range, as much as the personal preferences of the priests, some of whom are also known to be musically competent, for nine of the eleven parishes also indicated that the priest decides what is sung.

## 4.3.1 Ministerial Chants in English during Holy Week

The ministerial chants most commonly sung outside Sunday Mass are those that are sung once a year, for example, during the Easter Triduum. For example, 75.9% of parishes in the chant survey indicated that *This is the wood of the cross* is sung by the priest or musicians and congregation at the beginning of the Veneration of the Cross during the Celebration of the Lord's Passion on Good Friday. A similar percentage (74.5%) indicated that the Exultet ('Rejoice, heavenly powers . . .)' is sung during the Service of Light at the Easter Vigil, and just over half the parishes surveyed (53.3%) indicated that the Litany of the Saints is sung during the Liturgy of Baptism at the Vigil on Holy Saturday evening. For a minority of parishes (4.4%), including the Cathedral, solemnity is also conveyed by singing the Gospel recalling Christ's Passion on Good Friday, the most solemn day of the liturgical year.

Although participants were not asked to indicate the reasons why various chants during Holy week are sung, it is possible to suggest some reasons. Firstly, from a purely practical perspective, the Holy Week chants are located in the Sacramentary (1975) and in some of the more comprehensive collections of liturgical music, making them accessible to priests and musicians. <sup>10</sup> Secondly, in terms of solemnity, the chanting of liturgical texts might be regarded as a more formal and dignified way of expressing the texts in their entirety on the 'night of nights' of the liturgical year rather than other musical settings. <sup>11</sup> Finally, it has been observed that ancient rites tend to retain archaic structures. <sup>12</sup> If 'archaic structures' include music, it is not surprising that the separate rites of Holy Week, whose origins can be traced to the fourth century, <sup>13</sup> employ melodies that are several centuries old.

# **Congregational Chant Liturgical Texts**

Whilst chant settings for the Proper of the Mass have been produced in English in recent years, <sup>14</sup> it appears that parishes outside the Cathedral rarely sing the proper texts. One notable exception occurs on Passion (or Palm) Sunday. Of the parishes surveyed, 34.3% sing the *Hosanna to the Son of David* antiphon at the beginning of the liturgy and 13.1% sing *The Children of Jerusalem* antiphon

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Catholic Worship Book (1985) 259,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> For alternatives to the chant settings, eg, see *Exultet/Light of Christ* by Marty Haugen and Litany of the Saints by John Becker in *Gather Australia* (1995) 406, 552.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Aidan Kavanagh, *Elements of Rite: A Handbook of Liturgical Style* (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1982).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Nathan Mitchell, 'Holy Week' in Richard McBrien (ed.), *The HarperCollins Encyclopedia of Catholicism* (New York: HarperCollins, 1995) 636-637.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Paul Ford, By Flowing Waters (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1999).

during the Procession with Palms. Of the 16 parishes that indicated they sing both these chants each year, 14 also indicated they use the *Catholic Worship Book* in which both items are published whilst 7 indicated they used *Gather Australia*, in which only *Hosanna to the Son of David* is included. This trend suggests that the accessibility of chant in local compilations has a direct bearing on whether chant is sung in parishes.

Another influential factor on whether or not the proper texts are sung is the length of the antiphon. Hosanna to the Son of David (GA 311) comprises only four musical phrases and is printed without accompanying verses. The short length of this setting may not be sufficient to cover the ritual action in some parishes and could be a reason why two-thirds of the parishes choose an alternative to this antiphon on Palm Sunday. The musical setting of The Children of the Hebrews in the Catholic Worship Book, on the other hand, is longer and does include verses from Psalm 23(24) which are set to a simplified psalm tone. Whilst a small number of parishes sing this chant each year, it is possible that for a larger majority (86.9%), this liturgical text presumes a cantor or group who can lead the refrain and verses and a congregation that is provided with access to the text or music. These are factors that cannot be presumed in all parishes.

## **Congregational Chant Hymns**

Since the introduction of the new English Order of Mass in 1969, one of the most important forms of congregational musical participation has been the singing of hymns. By far the most popular chant style hymn sung by Catholics in Melbourne is *O Come, O Come Emmanuel* which is used during Advent by 87.6% of parishes surveyed. The late English chant scholar Mary Berry (1918-2008) is credited with tracing the melody back to a 15<sup>th</sup> century French liturgical source. To the basis of Berry's research and the chant style arrangements of the melody in some hymnals, recent scholars have suggested that the hymn can be regarded as genuine plainsong. Liturgically, *O Come, O Come Emmanuel* is based on the 'O' Antiphons prayed before and after the Magnificat at Evening or Night Prayer during the Liturgy of the Hours in the week before Christmas. The paraphrase version of the ninth century hymn

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Psalm 118 (117V) 1, 22-23, 27-28. For an English chant setting, see Paul Ford, *By Flowing Waters* (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1999) no. 102, p. 60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Catholic Worship Book (1985) 228.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Wesley Milgate and D'Arcy Wood, *A Companion to Together in Song – Australian Hymn Book II* (Sydney: Australian Hymn Book Co. 2007) 185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Wesley Milgate and D'Arcy Wood, *A Companion to Together in Song – Australian Hymn Book II* (Sydney: Australian Hymn Book Co. 2007) 185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The Divine Office (London: Collins & Sydney: Dwyer, 1974).

*Veni, Veni Emmanuel* by English linguist and translator John Mason Neale (1818-1866) has been published in Australian Catholic sources since the early 1960s.<sup>20</sup> One factor that may account for why this hymn is sung widely across the Archdiocese is that it can be repeated over four weeks each year, unlike the Passion Sunday antiphons that are sung and heard on *one* day each year.

Another chant hymn sung in just over half parishes surveyed (51.1%) is Sing my tongue, a translation of the Latin hymn Pange lingua by St Thomas Aguinas (1227-1274), translated by either Edward Caswall (1814-1878)<sup>21</sup> contemporary Scottish Jesuit writer James Quinn (b. 1919). Before the Second Vatican Council, the hymn was assigned for use during the Office of Vespers on the feast of Corpus Christi<sup>22</sup> and also for use during Benediction.<sup>23</sup> English translations appeared in the 1960s for use during Low Mass and devotions, <sup>24</sup> however, the hymn is probably sung less now than it was before the Council due to the general decline in parish devotions and the fact that some postconciliar liturgical documents suggest that some hymns formerly associated with Benediction are not as appropriate during Communion in the reformed liturgy because of their focus on adoration.<sup>25</sup> The use of this hymn for the procession with the Blessed Sacrament to the Altar of Repose at the conclusion of Mass of the Lord's Supper on Holy Thursday would seem to be another example of the use of chant to express solemnity during the climax of the Church's liturgical year: the celebration of the Easter Triduum.

A third chant hymn sung by small proportion of Melbourne Catholic parishes (18.2%), particularly during the Easter season, is *O Sons and Daughters*, a translation of the Latin chant *O filii et filae*, <sup>26</sup> one that can be traced back at least to 1623. <sup>27</sup> The melody of *O sons and daughters* was first published in Australia in 1942 alongside other music for the Proper of the Easter season. <sup>28</sup> The English translation by John Mason Neale is based on a Latin text by French Franciscan friar Jean Tisserand (d. 1494)<sup>29</sup> and, like *O Come*, *O Come* 

 $<sup>^{20}</sup>$  The Living Parish Hymn Book (Sydney: Living Parish Hymn Book, 1961-1968) no. 51 and The Hymnal of St Pius X (Melbourne: Allans, 1966) no. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Catholic Worship Book (1985) no. 252 or Gather Australia (1995) 320.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Liber Usualis (Tornaci: Desclée, 1931) 808.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Percy Jones (ed.), *The Australian Hymnal* (Melbourne: Advocate Press, 1941) no. 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The Living Parish Hymn Book (1961-1968) no. 84.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> 'Music in Catholic Worship' (1972) 62 in *The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource*, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. Vol. 1 (2004) 288.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Liber Usualis (Tornaci: Desclée, 1931) 1574.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Wesley Milgate and D'Arcy Wood, *A Companion to Together in Song – Australian Hymn Book II* (Sydney: Australian Hymn Book Co. 2007) 267.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> The Australian Hymnal (Melbourne: Advocate Press, 1941) 59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> As One Voice (1992) or Gather Australia (1995)

*Emmanuel*, the hymn was originally associated with the Divine Office.<sup>30</sup> Again, like many arrangements of *O Come, O Come Emmanuel*, and the Office hymns in general (eg. *Veni Creator*) the regular rhythmic pulse may foster congregational participation and thus contribute towards the chant's use in some Catholic parishes.

## **Congregational Chant Mass Settings**

The Latin chant Masses from the Liber Usualis that were published and used in Melbourne before the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965), such as Missa de Angelis (no. VIII), Cum jubilo (no. IX) and Orbis factor (no. XI), have not been published in local hymnals since. According to the chant survey, these Latin Mass settings are now used rarely; the *Missa de Angelis*, for example, is used in only 5.8% of parishes. The most commonly used chant Mass in Melbourne's parishes is the Missa Emmanuel by American composer and choral director. Richard Proulx (b. 1937). As the title suggests, Missa Emmanuel is based on the Advent chant hymn Veni, Emmanuel or O Come, O Come Emmanuel. First published in 1991 as an arrangement for unaccompanied choir, cantor and assembly,<sup>31</sup> the Mass was subsequently published in an arrangement for cantor. congregation and organ.<sup>32</sup> Missa Emmanuel was brought to the attention of Melbourne parishes in September 1999 when Richard Proulx spent a month as composer-in-residence at St Patrick's Cathedral.<sup>33</sup> During his visit, Proulx conducted workshops showcasing other chant-based material such as his Corpus Christi Mass, 34 which is sung by 5.1% of the parishes surveyed, and Two Plainsong Gloria Settings in English, the second of which is based on the Gloria from the Missa de Angelis. 35 Proulx describes the style of his chantbased Masses as 'call and response,' one that has the potential to evoke instant congregational participation. This approach harmonises with the post-conciliar liturgical call for composers to produce compositions that have qualities proper to genuine sacred music (eg chant) that also fosters the active participation of the entire assembly of the faithful. The results from the chant survey suggest

<sup>31</sup> Richard Proulx, *Missa Emmanuel* for SATB voices, Cantor and Congregation (Chicago: GIA, 1991).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Wesley Milgate and D'Arcy Wood, *A Companion to Together in Song – Australian Hymn Book II* (Sydney: Australian Hymn Book Co. 2007) 267.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Richard Proulx, Four Masses for Cantor, Assembly and Organ Based on Popular Chant Hymns (Chicago: GIA, 2002).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> 'Richard Proulx – Composer-in-Residence at St Patrick's Cathedral' in *Kairos* 10:18 (19-26 September 1999) 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Chicago: GIA, 1992.

<sup>35</sup> Chicago: GIA, 1991.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Richard Proulx, 'Performance Notes' in *Four Masses*, for Cantor, Assembly and Organ based on Popular Chant Hymns (Chicago: GIA, 2002). See also *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* (1963) 121 in *The Liturgy Documents* (2004) 26.

that an obvious reason why *Missa Emmanuel* is the most popular chant-based Mass setting is that the carol on which it is based is the most popular chant *hymn* sung during the liturgical year. The *Missa Emmanuel* represents a pastorally useful model for introducing old and potentially new chant melodies to congregations because it capitalizes on the responsorial style of singing that has been employed successfully in other ritual contexts such as the Responsorial Psalm, whereby congregations literally echo what has first been modeled for them by a cantor.

Survey	Mass V111	Mass	Missa	Corpus	Others
No	de Angelis	XV111	Emmanuel	Christi Mass	
6	Y		Y		
10	Y	Y	Y		Y eg.
					Missa primitiva
42			Y	Y	
89	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y eg.
					Paschal Mass
99	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y eg.
					Te Deum Mass
					Paschal Mass
101			Y	Y	
115			Y	Y	Y eg.
					Paschal Mass,
					Responsorial
					Gloria
119	Y	Y			Y eg. Vredo
					111, Agnus Dei
					from Masses 1,
					1V, X, XV11,
					XV111
130			Y	Y	

Survey No	Mixed Voice	Cantor/ Leader	Who decides	Budget range
	Choir	of song	what is sung?	in \$
	eg. SATB			
6			LTM, MC	500-1000
10	Y	Y	PP, MC	10,000
				or more
42		Y	PP, PA,	500-1000
			LTM, Org	

Survey No	Mixed Voice	Cantor/ Leader	Who decides	Budget range
	Choir	of song	what is sung?	in \$
	eg. SATB			1
89	Y	Y	P, MC, Org	10,000
				or more
99	Y	Y	MC, Org	10,000
_				or more
101		Y	MC	5,000-
				10,000
115	Y		PP, LS	3,000-
				5,000
119	Y	Y	MC	10,000
				or more
130	Y	Y	LS	10,000
				or more

Figure 4: Parishes that Use Two or More Chant-based Masses Abbreviation Kev:

Y = Yes; CM = Choir Master, GL = Group Leader, LTM = Liturgy Team Member, LS = Leader of Song, MC = Music Coordinator, O = Organist, P = Priest, PA = Pastoral Associate

The results included in Figure 4 offer a summary profile of those parishes that use two or more chant Masses. It is clear there are some parishes that sing chant Masses in English only, namely the *Missa Emmanuel* and the *Corpus Christi Mass*. Some other parishes (or Mass centres) sing various chant settings in both Latin and English. Where this is done, the budget range is \$10,000 or more and the parish is served by both choir(s) and cantor(s). In the latter case, the Music Coordinator is directly involved in the selection of music and sometimes the priest also. One may observe that where several chant Masses are used, it tends to be in parishes with choral or vocal leadership and musical coordinators and often priests who clearly decide to incorporate the chant genre into the parish's repertory of liturgical music for liturgical or musical reasons or both.

## The Weekly Cycle

Within the weekly cycle, chant is most likely to be sung during Sunday Mass rather than weekday Mass: Sunday Mass (including the vigil) represents the largest, regular gathering of parishioners each week, the liturgy is normally served by a range of liturgical ministers, including musicians, and singing is increasingly experienced as a regular component of the celebration, with the possible exception of the early Sunday morning Mass. Just over half (52.6%) of the parishes indicated that cantors/leaders of song or a music group (54%) serve

in their parish, however, the percentage of cantors/leaders of song and music groups that use chant-based settings of liturgical texts was much lower (21.2% and 18.2% respectively).

At weekend Masses, chant is employed to add solemnity during those more important parts, namely the Liturgy of the Word and the Liturgy of the Eucharist.<sup>37</sup> The chant survey indicated that the plainchant Alleluia (mode VI) is sung in 65% of parishes surveyed as an Acclamation before the highpoint of the Liturgy of the Word – the Gospel reading - when the Church believes Christ is present in the proclamation of his word.<sup>38</sup> It may also be observed on the basis of the high percentage of parish respondents that sing the Eucharistic acclamations (69.3%) that some chant is also employed during the Liturgy of the Eucharist (eg. as invitations to the Memorial Acclamation and Great Amen) when the Holy Spirit is invoked to change the gifts of bread and wine into the body and blood of Christ<sup>39</sup>

# The Yearly Cycle

Just as chant tends to feature during important sections of the Sunday Mass, chant is also used during certain seasons of the Church's year, particularly Advent and Holy Week which precede the most solemn celebrations of the liturgical cycle, Christmas and Easter. It has been noted that some chant-style hymns such as *O Come*, *O Come Emmanuel* are sung during the *four weeks* of Advent (by 87.6% or respondents). Other liturgical texts, such as *This is the Wood of the Cross* are sung (by 75.9% of respondents) on Good Friday and the Exultet (by 74.5% of respondents) at the Easter Vigil, are used by parishes *once* each year. The fact that congregations sing these and other chants for limited seasons or particular liturgies each year may partly account for why they are widely used. Like Christmas carols, these chants are strongly associated with the limited time frame in which they are used and they help people to identify and recognize seasonal changes and recurring ritual celebrations. Those chants that are used at least once a year (eg. the Exultet and Litany of the Saints) become gradually ingrained in the collective memory of congregations.

# Which Ministers Sing Chant?

The singing of chant in the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne varies according to the respective role of the liturgical ministers within the diocese and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> General Instruction of the Roman Missal (2002) 28 in The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. (Chicago: LTP, 2004) 42.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy (1963) art. 7 in The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. (Chicago: LTP, 2004) 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> General Instruction of the Roman Missal (2002) art. 79d in The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource, 4<sup>th</sup> ed. (Chicago: LTP, 2004) 54.

parish in which they serve. The ministerial chants intended to be sung by the ordinary minister of the Eucharist (i.e. bishop, priest or deacon) are included in the Order of Mass in Sacramentary. By contrast, the singing of chant by the extraordinary ministers in parishes (i.e. lay people) is characterised by greater diversity because there is a larger range of generally legitimate options from which music can be drawn. It can also be noted that ministerial chants are normally dependant on the ministry of the presiding celebrant: if he sings, the people sing! On the other hand, the singing of congregational chant-based texts other than the ministerial chants is not necessarily dependant on the minister, but on the person responsible for choosing the music.

#### **Priests**

Of the 74 priests who completed the chant survey, the majority of priests tend to sing the invitations to the acclamations sung by the congregation during the Eucharistic Prayer. Whilst eleven parishes indicated most if not all of the ministerial chants are sung, this represents only 14.9% of those participants who took part in the survey. Priests clearly exercise a very influential position in relation to the singing of the ministerial chants in dialogue with the congregation. On the basis of these different practices, it appears, that the Church's post-conciliar vision of a 'sung liturgy' has been interpreted by priests and people in different ways. For the majority of parishes, the liturgy is generally spoken but does include sung hymns, psalms and parts of the Mass. By contrast, in a smaller minority of parish communities, most of the liturgical texts tend to be sung, particularly the presidential prayers prayed by the priest and people in dialogue and together. One practical explanation that may account for why some priests sing but many do not is that anecdotal evidence suggests that those who do are naturally capable singers and enjoy singing whereas a larger majority may not feel confident in rendering their sung parts accurately by themselves.

#### Parish Musicians

In response to the chant survey's enquiry into which musical ministries serve in the parish and which ministries sing chant, the most prevalent musical ministry appears to be the music group represented in 54% of the parishes who responded, 18.2% of whom use chant-based settings. The music group is a less formal description than 'mixed voice choir' and emerged in relation to the post-conciliar phenomenon of using essentially guitar-based music with one or more lead singers. This practice was probably influenced by the 1960s popular music groups such as *The Seekers, Peter, Paul and Mary* and composers such as the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Eg Musicam sacram (1967) 16, 29 and the General Instruction of the Roman Missal (2002) 39-41.

Medical Mission Sisters (Miriam Therese Winter), Ray Repp and Carey Landry in North America, and Peter Kearney and Frank Andersen MSC in Australia whose music was conceived mostly for guitar with keyboard accompaniment. The prevalence of the guitar in contemporary liturgical music ensembles is indicated by the 52.6% of parish respondents who indicated that this instrument is used in their parish.

The second most commonly identified music ministry is that of cantor/leader of song represented in 52.6% of the parishes who responded. Cantors/leaders of song are one of the lay ministries that evolved in response to the Second Vatican Council's call for Catholics to take an active role in the Church's liturgy<sup>41</sup> and the Council's subsequent liturgical documents on the Eucharist<sup>42</sup> The fact that 63.5% of parish respondents indicated that musicians are located at the front of the church reflects the emergence of the cantor/leader of song as an influential mode of liturgical music ministry in Melbourne parishes today. The chant survey indicates that cantors/leaders of song, more than other musicians, use chant-based settings of liturgical texts (21.2% of parish respondents). This may be attributable to the fact that some chant-based liturgical texts (eg. the Exultet, Litany of the Saints, Gospel Acclamation (mode VI) and *Missa Emmanuel*) often involve the ministry of a solo cantor rather than a larger group of singers in dialogue with the people.

Despite the fact that international and local studies of church music make the generally valid point that choral music has declined dramatically in Catholic parishes since the liturgical reforms of the 1960s, 43 the chant survey suggests that mixed voice choirs still serve in just over a third (35%) of parish respondents, whilst 30.7% of respondents have a children's choir, some of which may also be associated with the parish primary school. A difference, however, can be discerned in relation to the use of chant by both types of choirs. Whereas 16.8% of parishes with choirs indicate that chant settings of liturgical texts are employed, only 4.4% or parishes with children's choirs make the same claim. This finding represents an important historical development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy (1963) 14, 27 in The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed., Vol. 1 (Chicago: LTP, 1991) 12, 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> General Instruction of the Roman Missal (1969, 1975) 36, 64 in The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Vol. 1 (Chicago: LTP, 1991) 56, 63 and General instruction of the Roman Missal (2002) 61, 104 in The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource, 4<sup>th</sup> ed., Vol. 12 (Chicago: LTP, 2004) 49, 59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Andrew Wilson-Dickson, *The Story of Christian Music: From Gregorian Chant to Black Gospel* (Oxford: Lion Publishing, 2003) 223-225; Geoffrey Cox, 'Church Music' in Warren Bebbington (ed.), *The Oxford Companion to Australian Music* (Melbourne: Oxford University Press, 1997) 120-126; here, 123.

since the Second Vatican Council: unlike the pre-Conciliar practice whereby the hymnals containing chant used in schools were also used in parishes, much of the music used in Catholic primary schools today is not published in the collections like *As One Voice* Vol. 1 (1992) and *Gather Australia* (1995), but is disseminated to Catholic primary schools by individual composers and commercial publishers, most all of which is not based on pre-existing textual or musical sources, including chant.<sup>44</sup>

A similar trend can be observed in relation to the limited use of chant by ethnic and youth choirs. 22.6% of parishes indicated they have an ethnic choir, whilst youth choirs serve in 20.4% of parishes. However, only 3.6% of parishes indicated that their youth choirs use chant whilst just 2.9% indicated that their ethnic choirs use chant compositions. When one compares the number of parishes in the chant survey who indicated their parish has a youth choir with the number who use instruments other than an organ, keyboard or guitar (28.5%) it would appear there is a connection. Nearly half (46.4%) of the respondents who indicated their parish has a youth choir also indicated their parish uses instruments other than the organ or keyboard, such as violin, flute, trumpet and drums. Whilst string, woodwind, brass and percussion instruments are sometimes used at Masses attended by a mixed congregation of younger, middle-aged and older people, the other instruments which are also associated with school bands and orchestral ensembles are also characteristics of Mass with young people and are often used to accompany non-chant genres of liturgical music characterized by regular rhythmic patterns, harmonic and melodic embellishment.

SATB	Music	Youth	Ethnic	Children's	Cantor/Leader	Other
Choir	Group	Choir	Choir	Choir	of Song	(eg Soloists
Serves	Serves	Serves	Serves	Serves &	Serves &	at Weddings
&	&	&	and	Uses	Uses Chant	and Funerals
Uses	Uses	Uses	Uses	Chant		serve &
Chant	Chant	Chant	Chant			use chant
16.8%	18.2%	3.6%	2.9%	4.4%	21.2%	3.6%

Figure 5: Parish Music Ministries that Use Chant

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> According to the *Survey of Liturgical Music at Sunday Celebrations of the Eucharist* (Melbourne: Office for Worship, June 2004) Q. 13, representative composers of liturgical music for children include Michael Mangan (QLD), Monica Brown (NSW), John Burland (NSW), Christopher Walker (UK/USA) and Bernadette Farrell (UK). The commercial self-promotion by local composers is represented by the following websites: <a href="http://www.litmusproductions.com/prod.html">http://www.litmusproductions.com/prod.html</a> (Mangan),

http://www.emmausproductions.com/productsAU/index.php?cPath=21 (Brown) and http://www.users.bigpond.com/johnburland/ (Burland) (last accessed 24 October 2008).

#### Conclusion

From this discussion of the data from the survey of chant practices in Melbourne, several major conclusions have emerged. First, the singing of chant tends to be associated with solemnity. The chants sung by the majority of parish respondents are those that occur during the most solemn moments of the Mass, namely the Gospel and Liturgy of the Eucharist, and the most solemn celebration of the liturgical year, notably the Easter Triduum. The common practice of singing parts of the Mass during an essentially spoken Mass represents the historical evolution of the pre-Conciliar Low Mass with hymns to a post-Conciliar Low Mass with hymns, sung psalms, acclamations and service music. The second finding is that ministerial chants are sung in a small minority of parishes. This finding represents the evolution of the pre-Conciliar sung Mass to a post-Conciliar sung Mass or at least an attempt to 'sing the Mass' as envisioned by Musicam sacram (1967). A third finding is that the singing or non-singing of chant varies amongst the various music groups used in parishes, the access they have to published versions of chant and the competency level of local parish musicians. The musicians most likely to use chant settings of liturgical texts are cantors/leaders of song who are often the best sight singers in parishes, followed by music groups and mixed voice choirs. The groups least likely to sing chant in parishes are children's choirs, youth choirs and ethnic choirs.

The singing of chant, therefore, appears to play at least a limited but nonetheless important role in most parishes and its use depends largely on the priests and parish musicians who can bring this chant to life and the solemnity of the liturgical context in which it is used. In addition to identifying trends in parish musical practice, the results from the chant survey raise several important questions that others may wish to explore in subsequent papers and seminars. For example, is chant still regarded as a valuable genre of liturgical music in parishes? Secondly, should those in positions of leadership in Catholic Liturgical dioceses (eg. Diocesan Commissions and Offices Worship/Liturgy) be doing more to promote the use of chant in parishes in keeping with official Church documents? Finally, is chant a distinguishing feature of the Roman Catholic Church's cultural identity? Unfortunately, these questions lie beyond the scope of this paper but are ones worthy of further reflection because answers to these questions will have a bearing on the practice of singing chant in parishes in the future.

# The 2009 AAL Conference Canberra, 19-22 January 2009 Reports and Papers

# Dr David Pitman, Academy President

Next year will mark the 30<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the gathering in Adelaide, convened by Anthony Kain, which led to the formation of the AAL. We thank those pioneers for the vision and commitment they invested in the establishment and development of the Academy.

As we approach this milestone in the life of the Academy, it is worth reminding ourselves of our stated purpose:

- To provide channels for mutual professional assistance and for sharing of methods and resources
- To exchange information concerning recent developments in liturgical matters
- To communicate information concerning research projects and activities of its members
- To foster liturgical research, publication, and dialogue at a scholarly level
- To publish the Australian Journal of Liturgy
- To encourage exchanges with individuals and communities of other religious traditions

I have no doubt that the Academy has informed and helped shape the work undertaken by its members in their various capacities. The degree to which we have influenced the liturgical practice of our denominations is much harder to measure.

I want to say, arising from my own experience, that participation in the activities of the Academy, through Chapter Meetings and Conferences, has been a highlight of my ministry in both theological education and parish life over the past 20 years.

We are, by nature, somewhat loosely knit together by common interest and discipline. Our members are generally very busy people. Chapter Meetings have always been, and will continue to be, the main way in which people can connect on a regular basis. The *Journal* provides an avenue for the publication of research and explorations of matters liturgical. Our Conferences, given the size of our membership, have usually been well supported and very worthwhile. Our most recent Conference, held in Canberra in January, was no exception. Just over fifty of us gathered for three days of stimulating presentations, rigorous conversation and good fellowship.

The major theme for the Conference was 'The Liturgical Year' with one focus dealing with the dissonance between the language, imagery and symbolism of the liturgy and real time in the Southern Hemisphere. This theme was chosen to help us prepare for the *Societas Liturgica* Conference that will convene in Sydney from the 10-15 August this year.

This was another Conference during which we drew particularly on the skills and wisdom of our own members: a very important and valuable thing to do. The keynote address was delivered as a public lecture by Dr Clare Johnson. The title of her paper was: 'Grounding the Timeless in Place: Exploring the Influence of the Physical Environment on Liturgical Conceptions of Time.' Clare is Senior Lecturer in Sacramental Theology at The University of Notre Dame Australia (Fremantle, WA).

Drs Anita Monro, Tom Elich and Charles Sherlock have been invited by *Societas* to offer papers at the Congress from an Australian perspective. On the first morning of our Conference they shared their work with us as they had developed it to that point in time and this was followed by reflection on their presentations in small groups and a plenary session for questions and feedback. That afternoon, other members of the Academy presented papers on a variety of subjects consistent with the theme of the Conference It was a particular pleasure, during the General Meeting of the Academy, held on the last morning of the Conference, to present a Certificate of Honorary Life Membership of the Academy on Ray Hartley, in recognition of his many years of service to the Academy, particularly as Editor of the *AJL*.

The General Meeting also decided that the current Executive, based in Brisbane, would serve for a further two years, and that the next Conference would be held in Melbourne in January 2011.

This Conference was notable for the level of energy that was apparent during small group and plenary sessions, the stimulating (and challenging) nature of the papers presented by members, and the happy spirit and good fellowship that prevailed throughout.

Now we look forward to the *Societas* Congress in August We are very grateful to Carmel Pilcher, Tom Elich and Cathy Murrowood and the Australian Planning Committee for the way in which they represent us internationally, and for the fine work they did in gaining support for this next Congress to be held here in Australia. We extend our very best wishes to Tom, Anita Monro, Charles Sherlock and Clare Johnson as they each make their special contribution.

## Members' Papers at Canberra: Circle of the South Land John Bunyan

I am very fortunate that while I can look out from my bed-room window in my little house on undeveloped very Australian open land with a few tall eucalypts that have stood there for a very long time, closer to the house, within a hedge, it is different. There the passing of the seasons is clearly marked because of the very different vegetation — with willows beside a creek, and a jacaranda, and a Persian silk tree, a liquid amber, bougainevillea, which I was surprised to find is also deciduous, and at the front, an ornamental peach, great bottle brush trees bright red in *their* season and, most beautiful of all in autumn, the claret ash — all in varying ways marking the circle of the year in my particular little corner of this South Land of the Holy Spirit.

Of course, our Christian faith is first of all concerned with un-repeatable, non-cyclical historical events and their interpretation, but that is *within* the annual round, the repeated course of the civil and the Christian year, and behind both the civil and the Christian year, the repeated course of the God-given *natural* year.

Kosuke Koyama wrote, in *Waterbuffalo Theology* (SCM 1974, p.27), that 'we see the glory of God both in history and in nature. Circular nature shows God's glory as much as linear history... Yet circular nature finds its proper place within linear history.' More than 30 years since he wrote that, I suppose we feel more than ever that faith and worship should be related in some ways to the book of nature through which God also speaks, here and elsewhere. Perhaps some words in the *Tablet* recently, from Father Daniel O'Leary, tip the balance too far in one direction but he writes 'God's secrets are strewn extravagantly around us.... Nothing has ever been written about God's beautiful presence that hasn't been better traced in the crystal calligraphy of a frosty morning. Nothing has ever been preached by saints about divine intimacy that hasn't been better sung by the summer wind in the road-side trees.'

I must quickly say that how one links the liturgy with nature, with the life of the sky and the soil say, in northern Australia, where the seasons are simply the Wet and the Dry is not my subject here. There it is the coming of the Wet whenever that happens to occur that one might celebrate in church and that is one theme that I noticed at the end of the film 'Australia' with reference to the return of the green.

Further south, in the centre and in other parts of Australia where the main difference is between good seasons and bad, and where there are droughts and flooding rains, thanksgiving will come whenever droughts or floods happen to end. And the church's year will not really interact with that, other than by chance. Indeed one book to which we should certainly refer in relation to this subject is Les Murray's great work, *The Australian Year: The Chronicles of our Seasons and Celebrations*, (Angus & Robertson, 1985). He shows how richly varied is the Australian year from place to place even within that part of Australia of which I shall be speaking, the *southern* part — with comparable regions in New Zealand, for example, or South Africa.

Here we have a more regular seasonal pattern — although less sharply marked than in our homelands in the northern hemisphere. There the approach of winter is gloomier, and it is not surprising that ancient Britons experienced dismay at the approach of winter and fear that the sun would not return. That fear is reflected in pagan and then Christian rituals that survive, for instance, at Scottish hallowe'en and in the commemoration of All Souls and which have led in turn to November being the month of the dead — reinforced in our time by the remembrance of war on Armistice Day.

November still speaks to *us* at least of All Souls' and of Remembrance but otherwise the sun is probably shining, and for many it is a time for the first of the end of year gatherings, and – as in the north of course, the often fraught season of preparation for, it might seem, a fairly secular celebration, focused more on family and friends than on the specifically Christian festival.

Nowadays, in the Church itself, Christmas carol services before the festival are the norm, reinforced by the fact that in Australia Christmas is immediately followed for many by the summer holidays, and to a considerable degree we have to adapt to this, although in my own parish we tried to counter the culture to some extent by a fairly quiet Advent season, the church devoid of flowers, the altar frontal a medieval Advent blue, although perhaps jacaranda blue and flame tree red would be very fitting.

As for Christmas itself, it comes us for at the beginning of summer, and some measure of what some describe as dissonance is only evident when for so long in the old countries from which so many Australians have come, and still come, it has been a winter solstice festival.

Australians and New Zealanders of course have pondered this for a very long time although Christmas services of any kind were very rare in non-Anglican, Protestant churches until comparatively recently. However, in Mrs Aeneas Gunn's We of the Never Never we can read of how Christmas was happily celebrated at Elsey Station more than a hundred years ago by its Presbyterian maluka and his wife, Mrs Gunn perhaps more influenced by Charles Dickens than by Calvinistic church decrees— and was celebrated then in a very Australian fashion, not with any church service as far as I remember, but with a wonderful Christmas dinner out of doors. And there was a brief reprise of that scene, intentional or accidental, in the Christmas meal in that same film, 'Australia'. Meals, like that, of course, are not entirely different to the meals our Lord enjoyed.

As for other Australian Christmases, I was interested to notice that early in the 20<sup>th</sup> century the Christmas cards sent to or from my grandmother—in the form of post-cards—were mostly very Australian in character. Many had Australian Christmas flowers and decorations, and I'd have to add, hardly any had pictures of the Nativity. Cards with such Australian designs would be not so common today despite all our talk of inculturation.

Again, the 1936 Australian edition of *The Book of Common Praise*, the only Australian *Anglican* hymn ever officially authorised, and still in use, is interesting. It has two Australian Christmas hymns, one that begins 'Vermilion glow the Christmas bells - and it continues a bit further on, 'and summer colour peals in joy, from earth to sky above, as blue as Mary's mantle wrapt- about the Lord of love. O Christmas bells, ring far, ring free, ring 'Glory, Lord of life, to thee.'

Another hymn in that book, by Alice Allnutt, written in 1915, begins, 'When Jesus Christ came down to earth, in days of long ago', and continues a bit further on with, 'Our sunny southern bushland lay: by white man's foot untrod', and later with 'the wandering tribesmen could not hear: the angels' song above: yet still the Cross swept round the sky: the symbol of God's love'. This hymn goes on to speak of maiden-hair spreading a carpet for Mary's weary feet, and of the Christmas bush, and of mimosa's gold and frankincense, of blood-red sap for the myrrh of pain, of the flame trees burning their signal fires, and it likens the red-gold of the Christmas bells to the fringe of scarlet and gold on the high priest's robe.

None of them is outstanding, but of course there are the much better Australian carols by John Wheeler, with the tunes of William Garnet James, that deserve more frequent use. New Zealand has also produced fine carols for a southern Christmas.

And yet, English and Irish and Scottish memories of northern Christmases have been reinforced by the memories of many more recent European and Middle Eastern immigrants, so that I think any Australian element in our Christmas celebrations is a good deal less than it was in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. We may sing one or two of those Australian carols in church but outside church many more will sing of dashing through the snow.

In the place of the usual words of that song, written together with the tune by Unitarian Christian hymn-writer, John Pierpoint, as children we only knew to that tune the words 'Christmas eve is here & we go off to bed', etc. Later in my parish church we sang new words (originally beginning 'Christmas Bowl each year...', being the national ecumenical appeal for gifts of charity), more and more softly, to the tinkling of bells,

God's call comes each year, comes on Christmas Day, asking for our gifts on our Lord's birthday; think of how they help aged and sick and poor — may we cheerfully respond and share God's gifts once more. O—

Jingle bells, jingle bells, jingle all the way: give your gift to Christ our Lord on his own birthday: O – jingle bells, jingle bells, jingle far away, as we help the living Christ rejoice this Christmas Day.

But we also often happily sang Christina Rossetti's beautiful poem, 'In the bleak midwinter', perhaps reminding a congregation that our fellow Christians in the north were celebrating the birth of Jesus at the same time as us, and for them, according to tradition that goes back to the first establishing of the feast, in the depths of winter.

Again, among our decorations we shall almost certainly have holly at Christmas whether home grown without berries at that time of the year or plastic, and perhaps mistletoe which our farmers know only too well, but *also* Christmas bush and that most beautiful of Australian Christmas flowers, the Christmas bell already been mentioned.

Nonetheless, when I happened to look at the famous windows of a Sydney store last Christmas, all the scenes as usual were scenes in the snow, and at Christmas one can see imitation snow all over the place. It would indeed seem strange and probably less special and magical for children, I guess, if the scenes in the window were of an Australian Christmas (and I myself would not want to take that magic away from Christmas). The association is almost inevitable and indeed my own most memorable Christmas was a sunny, white Christmas in Durham when I was a student long ago. And artificial snow anyhow will be just as common in stifling Singapore and in the burning heat of Mrs Jellyby's Borrioboola Gha on the west bank of the Niger. I think we just have to accept a nice blending of summer and winter in our southern Australian Christmas.

Our weather helps us, however, when we come to the conclusion of the Twelve Days of Christmas. Some of the shops and some of the people put away the wise men by then, and the decorations, although when people are reminded of what my true love has sent to me on the first and all the other days of Christmas, in quite a few places, the decorations remain. And the Twelfth Day I think we should still carefully observe on the right day, in the company of the wise men and envy Italy, for example, where 6 January is still certainly a public holiday.

On the other hand, in the West in much earlier times the Epiphany was the Festival of the Baptism (as it is still in the East), and indeed the story of the Baptism of our Lord is still appointed to be read at Matins on the 6 January in the Book of Common Prayer.

Many western Churches of course now celebrate the Baptism on the following Sunday and we could well make more of this. Some of the Eastern Orthodox will go down to the beaches or the rivers to bless the waters. And in the hot days of our January, a festival of thanksgiving for water, for the water we need for life, for the waters of the seas and rivers, for the now endangered waters of Jordan, and of many of our own rivers, for the waters of our Lord's baptism and our own christening, with the splashing of the people with water in a perhaps hot church building all fit our place in the world better for example say than in the icy wastes of Russia.

Probably even hotter days follow until we come to our southern Easter, and here there is really no problem. I have rarely if ever heard people sing spring-time carols at our Easter celebrations. 'Some have been troubled', Les Murray writes, '...about the inversion in the Southern Hemisphere of religious and poetic symbols drawn from the northern world. Passover should be safe

enough: that celebrates a deliverance from bondage in a hot place; for Egypt, read summer.'

Although he goes on to say 'the theme is much more serious than that'... 'and is really to do with the miraculous survival of a people and its unique vision of the Divine. It isn't importantly a seasonal thing.' (p.176) Nonetheless, inspired by Les Murray's words, one of my hymns does link Easter with the end of the burning heat of summer, just as the Hebrews left behind them the heat of Egypt and of their journeying in the wilderness.

Easter for us in the southern parts of Australia and New Zealand comes in the usually lovely, mellow, maturing season of autumn and that helps to make it, as the chief Christian festival, an occasion of joy. In my own parish we tried to enter into the autumnal days of our Lord's life, celebrating the harvest of his life, and then, after the seven weeks, celebrated at Whitsunday (Pentecost) the harvest of the Spirit, the gifts of the Spirit of God. And we linked Anzac Day with all of that, thinking of the harvest that has come or could come from the tragic dying of so many. We did sing at least part of the - to some politically incorrect and to some theologically incorrect, but to me very moving hymn – 'O valiant hearts,' which concludes with the words, - and remember, we are thinking of Anzac Day in Eastertide,

O risen Lord, O Shepherd of our dead, whose Cross has bought them, and whose staff has led, in glorious hope their proud and sorrowing land commits her children to thy gracious hand.

In this Easter season we also celebrated our Harvest Festival. In Britain this was and remains a community farming festival at the end of September or at the beginning of October, originally harvest home, at the gathering in of the harvest In the later 19<sup>th</sup> century the festivity came into the church, or perhaps returned to, the church, and it migrated to Australia. Here, however, it has tended to disappear, at the same time as we have become highly urbanised – a great pity, for I think we need more than ever to acknowledge in the liturgy our reliance and dependence upon the God-given bounty of nature and of God's earth.

Of course, in Australia, seasons are far less rigidly defined and harvests come at all sorts of times, depending on what is planted and when it is brought in. In farming areas, a harvest festival would be best related to a particular harvest in a particular locality if there is such a harvest.

In my own suburban parish we chose the 5<sup>th</sup> Sunday after Easter Day, the Sunday before the Ascension, which in the northern hemisphere is the time of sowing in the spring. We kept the agricultural association of what Anglicans came to call Rogation Sunday but we linked it to an *autumn harvest* thanksgiving, with fruit and eggs and vegetables and flowers and so on brought to the church, and we sang the old harvest hymn, 'Come, ye thankful people come, raise the song of harvest-home. All is safely gathered in, ere the winter storms begin'.

An American writer, Mark Galli, commenting on the seasons of our land, notes that here 'Easter season ends as ... winter begins and light fades, reminding the church ... (in the south) that resurrection life is lived in the midst of a dark world', incidentally a reason, I think, for speaking of 'Sundays after Whitsun' or Pentecost throughout our winter and spring instead of or in addition to any other name. One of my hymns for Whitsunday speaks of the poinsettia, which in Australia often appropriately decorates the Church on that day.

As for our winters, they are mostly not too cold compared with Europe or North America, although they can be gloomy and grey, and I have written hymns to counter winter blues. However, thinking of winter, we know our memories of Christmas past will remain, and they have been sharpened in recent years as people have begun the custom of celebrating what is called Christmas in June, or Christmas in July, not only in cold places such as the Blue Mountains or the southern Alps but also more widely. I have wondered how this new custom might in a small way be linked to the liturgical year and I have suggested two possibilities.

July 2 in the Anglican Church celebrates the Coming of the Light, the bringing of Christianity to the islands of the Torres Strait. It is a big festival there but in the south, I thought it could be a more general festival celebrating the Light of Jesus in any winter of this world, and celebrated on or near that day, July 2, a festival therefore of Christmas in July.

The alternative, preferable I think, not least because more ecumenical, could be a celebration of Christmas in June, on 24 June, or in the week that follows that Festival day of the Birth of St John Baptist, 24 June being the traditional solstice, in our case the winter solstice. Even though the weather gets colder after 24 June, in fact the days *are* slowly lengthening, and I like to think of those days gradually leading us to the celebration of the coming of our Lord, the summer Sun of Righteousness. I have tried to put *this* idea also into a hymn which can be sung, appropriately to a Christmas tune, for Christmas in June, 'Filled with the Spirit from his birth'.

Then slowly comes the spring, less dramatically – except in the far south - than in northern Europe and America, usually changeable, irritating sometimes when windy from the west, and arriving at different times according to the latitude but geography might determine when we hold a spring festival in any particular parish or diocese.

Where spring comes early, a festival could be kept each year in association with the Festival of Transfiguration, in our Prayer Book calendar still in August, or at the festival of Saint Mary on 15 August, or if later, at the Nativity of our Lady on 8 September.

The best day to choose, however, might be a festival very important to the Orthodox, but found in Anglican and other calendars also, the Festival of the Holy Cross on 14 September.

I once wrote a collect for Holy Cross Day bringing in the theme of spring, to supplement the authorised Collect of the Day, and other collects for the spring which in my Church could be formally authorised as a variations. But only recently I noticed that in the Calendar of the important 1559 Book of Common Prayer (its 450<sup>th</sup> anniversary being celebrated this year) next to the words Holy Cross Day on the 14 September are the words 'Aequinoctium Autumnale', earlier than the strictly scientific equinox a week later. The link with an equinox has already been made! And I have recently written a hymn for that day. It begins 'In the springtime Mary's birth' but refers mainly to the Holy Cross.

Finally, I myself would not want to invent a season of Creation and insert it into the period after Pentecost and Trinity, as some are doing. Liturgy should evolve from what we already have, and I myself prefer to link Creation as the old lectionaries do with the 'Gesima Sundays before Lent when the Book of Genesis begins to be read at Matins and Evensong, fairly early in the new civil and natural year. With regard to new beginnings, our school year and much else begin again in February, in contrast to September in Britain or Europe, so here our civic and our natural year more readily coincide.

Whether we have the helpful 'Gesima reminders of the approach of Lent or not, one could also note that the festival of the Presentation on 2 February, a new beginning for our Lord, can be linked with what is going on in our outside world. And again, one of my hymns celebrates this Candlemas of the One who for all times and all seasons in the Light of the world.

The hymns referred to in John Bunyan's paper:

#### Hymn 1

#### God's call comes each year

The familiar original song was written by the Unitarian, John Pierpoint, writer of such hymns as 'O bow thine ear, Eternal One'. The hymn should be sung gently (and the bells rung likewise), and the final lines be sung softly.

## Hymn 2 (revised since Canticle Road & Celestial City)

See the purple jacaranda under southern skies of blue, royal purple, blue of summer - see a deeper meaning too;— with the winter now behind us and the crucial victory won, sign of God's own kingdom coming and the advent of God's son.

Agapanthus love, and flame trees, damp hydrangeas, herald birth, birth at hand of Mary's boy-child, sharing our own life on earth; hear God's messenger and prophet tell us that our God is near; tell of God's own new beginnings at the turning of the year.

In the restful days of summer cleansing waters of the sea bring refreshment of the spirit, unclad joyful liberty; so too, freely in the water Jesus looked to God above, and, as God's Son, walked from christening towards an autumn way of love.

Bring us, Father, to thy kingdom, keep us faithful on the way, through the winter, spring, and summer, till the ending of our day; thou the God of every season, (agapanthus = love flower) (hydrangea = water vessel) living Water, shining Sun, Spirit in all good creation and where heaven's borders run.

87.87 D eg Pleading Saviour

## Hymn 3

Let us sing a song of Easter, summer heat and Red Sea passed, celebrate the Resurrection after Lent and Friday fast; feared defeat becomes a victory on an autumn harvest day; from the Tree, leaves red and yellow lie upon the Shepherd's way.

And though desert wait before us, yet the cloud of Light will guide to a springtime after winter when we cross to Jordan's side: journey toward the land of promise and before that journey end.

Rock bring forth a well of water, God the bread of heaven send.

Glory be to God the Saviour who, by crossing at the Sea, in the mellow time of autumn gave us fruit to set us free, harvest of the life of Jesus, truth and beauty of the Son, harvest of the holy Spirit, now and when all time is done.

87.87D Trochaic. Tune: e.g Abbot's Leigh, Hymn to Joy, Lux Eoi (even When the carnival is over?!)

# Hymn 4

# Pentecost poinsettia -

Whitsun's red and fiery flame, tells of those wise, warming days when God's holy Spirit came.

Sudden gale at morning prime\* brings encouragement and calm,

and the holy Ghost gives joy, cleansing grace and christening balm.

Celebrate the Spirit's gifts, Christ to be of them the sum – risen now and promising God's own autumn time to come.

To be melded with God's peace, wake once more this Whitsuntide: Babel, Babylon is felled, beauty, goodness, truth abide.

77.77 Tune: eg. Buckland, Innocents, Vienna or 77.77 D Tune: St George (as in Christ the Lord is risen today)

Someone at the talk pointed out that poinsettia is now being imported from the UK for our Christmas!!

### Hymn 5

yellow soft against the grey, when the daffodils are golden on a short and sullen day, in the silent gloom of winter when it seems that life has fled,

When the wattle blooms in winter,

when it seems that life has fled, find in these a springtime promise bright among the sleeping dead.

Even in depressing seasons, faith and charity remain, (like to daffodil and wattle) 'midst all sorrow, loss, and pain: glimpses of our Father's glory, and the shining of the Son, and the Spirit's truth and beauty hope in God the holy One.

87.87 D Trochaic. Tune: eg. Deerhurst, Everton, Rex Gloriae, or as with most of these hymns, a tune in a more modern style.

<sup>\*</sup> This line alludes to words in a Whitsun hymn, 'When God of old came down from heaven,' by John Keble.

**Hymn 6** 24 June: Birth of St John Baptist or in the week following - 'Christmas in June':

Filled with the Spirit from his birth a Jewish boy was born — John given to Elizabeth, a prophet of God's dawn.

In dangerous mid-winter gloom, when faith and hope burnt low, John drew the people back to God and blazed the way to go.

Through Jordan's narrow, cleansing stream, as to a promised land, they went, converted from their sin, and held by God's good hand.

John Baptist's life is sparkling still, and frozen folk can learn that days will lengthen and at last the sun and light return.

For by God's grace we can repent and walk in wintry days with minds alert, hearts strangely warmed, to seek the kingdom's ways.

John Wesley's phrase

The sun of righteousness will rise with healing in his wings, when God in Christ's own summer-time a joyful Gospel brings.

So glory be to God on high, and to the earth be peace: for God's goodwill to humankind begun, shall never cease.

DCM. Tune: Winchester Old

Hymn 7 2 July: The Coming of the Light or in the week following —Christmas in July In the bleak and dreary season, faced by evil and by sin, watch for what is true and holy,

signs of seeds of life within. In the gloom of fear and failure, foolish error, bitter fight, in the midst of darkest winter, wait the coming of the Light.

In the courage of the Prophets, in the insights of the Law, in the wisdom of the Fathers, in what Moses heard and saw, in the searching of the scientists, in all seeking for the right, in the welcome signs of springtime, glimpse the dawning of the Light.

Soon the advent of the Saviour, and the warmth of summer days, God in Christ the light of living, and we therefore sing God's praise. Winter's woes will be defeated, if we trust in God's own might; in God's time we all shall surely see the coming of the light.

87.87 D Tune: eg. Blaenwern, Ebenezer, Nettleton

Hymn 8 recently written especially for Holy Cross Day
In the spring-time, Mary's birth
led in turn to God's great deed by the true Cross of her Son,
we from wintry chains are freed:
Pilate put our Lord to death
in a lonely sinner's place,
but the spring-time holy Cross
bears new leaves of hope and grace.

In that Cross of Christ we see consummation of his life healing words and welcoming, gathering friends and ending strife: and from it come wondrous woods, with their branches spring-time green 8 September

14 September

filled with his abundant life, flowering, sun-blest, and serene.

Therefore, on this holy day, to our spring-time God we sing, praises for the holy Cross of our Lord and earthly King: by his Spirit seek to grow - all made new that once was old, in the offering of a life, by this rabbi's heart of gold.

Eight 7s. Tune: eg. Aberystwyth, St George

## Hymn 9

#### With Saint Francis of Assisi

sing we praises to the Lord, to a God of grace and mercy by all saints in heaven adored – God who in the cross of Jesus human tribulation bore and whose Spirit lives especially in the children of the poor.

Sing of Francis – one who laboured to repair the house of God and who, putting wealth behind him, came and walked where Jesus trod, one who heard the voice of Jesus still to follow in his way, by the cross to bring God's people from the darkness to the day.

Live like him, forgiving others, sit with those who suffering bear, love, with him, the earth our mother, for her creatures gently care; sing of brother sun arising, sing of sister moon above, sing of sister death and always, tell of God's unfailing love.

87.87 Trochaic. Tune: eg. Deerhurst, Pleading Saviour or something in a more modern style

Three additional Collects written by John Bunyan:

# For Holy Cross Day, 14 September

O God our Saviour, who by the true cross of thy Son in Jerusalem hast delivered us from the power of the enemy, and given us in the spring-time the hope of the resurrection: grant that in newness of life we may share in his holy Spirit and, with the saints, on earth and in heaven, rejoice in the coming of thy kingdom; through the same Jesus Christ our Lord. *Amen*.

## **Other Spring-Time Collects**

O God, whose Spirit dwells in the true wonder of the world, and who glory fills all heaven and earth: grant that we may guard the goodness of thy creation with understanding and its beauty with wisdom; through Jesus Christ our Lord. Amen.

O God, by whose providence the winter doth yield to spring: grant by thy grace that the coldness of our hearts may yield to the sun of righteousness, even the saviour, Jesus Christ our Lord. Amen

This third collect is my revision of one written in the 1980s by a member and liturgist of King's Chapel, Boston, the late Mr Harry Stokes, who assisted with the most recent revision in 1985 of the King's Chapel Book of Common Prayer.

# Do 'the patterns framed by nature form the seasons of our hearts'?1

#### Alison Whish

Hymns form our theology in strong ways. Does it make a difference to how we understand seasons of the liturgical year, depending on whether the imagery contained in what we sing is drawn from the seasons of the northern or southern hemisphere? This paper will explore the hymns in a range of hymnals currently in use, explore whether hymn writers draw on seasonal imagery to convey meaning related to significant festivals in the liturgical year and raise some questions as to the impact on liturgical celebration and theological understanding when seasonal imagery is used.

#### Introduction

The genesis of this paper really came from two experiences within my last parish placement:

- 1. At Christmas, a couple of years ago when I briefly contemplated preaching on the story of Christina Rossetti's hymn 'In the Bleak Mid Winter'. I had been reading about her struggle with depression at the time that she had written it. I realised that this is a Christmas hymn that is virtually never sung in Australia, simply because it does not make sense in our context.
- 2. At Easter last year. One of the missional highpoints as far as I was concerned was the 6am. beach service on Easter Day. This service was traditionally shared with the other congregation in town, and steadily built up such that last year we had about 90 people present, less than a third of whom would have been people from either local congregation. You may recall that last Easter was very early, Easter Day being 23 March. Thus it was still in Eastern Australian daylight saving time and so dawn was at 7.20am. Therefore a vigil service on the beach from 6 a.m. (dictated by our need to conduct other services elsewhere in our broadly spread rural parishes) meant that my colleague and I would have been conducting a vigil completely in the dark, which did not make symbolic sense, especially when we knew that many of those worshipping would not be well educated in the tradition of the church. My Anglican colleague and I developed a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The title is adapted from Bill [William L.] Wallace's hymn, 'Autumn comes in all its fullness', Sacred Earth Holy Darkness, *Singing the Circle, Book 1*. Methodist Church New Zealand, 1990. These words have now been superseded by a revision soon to be published, in which each verse ends, 'for the seasons of our living/ mirror patterns nature penned'.

somewhat different service specifically for that occasion, but the detail falls beyond the scope of this discussion.

Both incidents though, along with discussion of the theme of the 'Liturgical Year', prompted me to think about the music we use in services across our traditions and to ask whether the imagery in our hymns and songs, especially those that are used seasonally at Christmas and Easter, contributes to the conceptual understanding of that season. Is there imagery that reflects the different experience of the seasons, dependent on whether we are located in the northern or southern hemisphere?

## Methodology

I undertook a survey of hymns currently in use, by doing content analysis of *Together in Song* [hereafter TiS], because it is a widely used ecumenical hymn book in the contemporary Australian context and of *Gather Australia*<sup>2</sup>, because it is one of the commonly used hymn collections in the Roman Catholic Church.

I was aware of the work of the New Zealand Hymn Book Trust in publishing a number of hymn collections with a specific Aotearoa New Zealand context, so I also included *Carol our Christmas*<sup>3</sup> and for a bit of northern hemisphere balance, *Common Ground*<sup>4</sup>, a recent Scottish ecumenical collection of hymns. In my travels I have found a few other examples from contemporary sources such as the *Songs for Pilgrims*<sup>5</sup> from the Pilgrim Uniting Church in Adelaide, and *Worshipping Ecumenically*<sup>6</sup> from the WCC in Geneva. It is not a hymn book per se but includes a wide range of material from many different cultures.

New Zealand hymn writer Bill Wallace, from the Methodist Church, poses the question I am seeking to explore:

Christmas bathed in sunlight!<sup>7</sup>
 Easter with no spring!

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Jane Wood, ed., *Gather Australia*: [an Australian hymnal], Ashburton, Vic.: NLMC Publications, 1995.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Carol our Christmas: A book of New Zealand carols, The New Zealand Hymnbook Trust, Raumati Beach, New Zealand, 1996.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Common Ground, A Song Book for all the Churches, Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 1998, ISBN 0715207539.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. 2008.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Per Harling, ed., Worshipping Ecumenically, Orders of Service from Global Meetings with Suggestions for Local Use, Geneva: WCC Publications. 1995, ISBN 2-8254-1141-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Wallace, Bill, 'Sacred Earth Holy Darkness', from Singing the Circle, Book 1.

How shall Southern Christians Festive praises sing? When we glimpse the symbols placed before our eyes can we sense their meaning? Will new songs arise?

- 2. Will the blood red rata<sup>8</sup>
  Matagouri's thorns,<sup>9</sup>
  cabbage trees' bright auras
  point to Easter morn?
  Will dry Lenten landscapes,
  Easter's lacebark flowers –
  give our Southern spirits
  evergreening powers?
- 3. Give us eyes that notice, hearts that ponder well; Set our faith in context, let our praises swell.

  Then within these islands framed by Treaty vows<sup>10</sup> we shall see God's beauty make God's justice ours.
- 4. Worship for the people set within the land, people in a circle dancing hand in hand. Praise God in the joining! Praise God in the mirth! Praise God in the Treaty! Praise God in the Earth!

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The rata is a native New Zealand tree, of the myrtle family, which produces prolific red flowers in season.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Matagouri, also known as Wild Irishman, is a native New Zealand thorn bush characterized by spines several centimetres long.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> This is the Treaty of Waitangi, in Maori: *Te Tiriti o Waitangi*, initially signed in 1840 between representatives of the British Crown and a number of Maori chieftains, much disputed but also honoured as a founding document of the nation of Aotearoa New Zealand.

The explicit New Zealand images described in this hymn make it less useful for Australian worshippers, but verse 1 does pose the question.

#### **Nature References**

There are somewhat more hymns that call on imagery more contextual for us here in Australia. Examples include –

TiS 672 'Lord of earth and all creation' by Michael and Honor Thwaites, with its mention of far horizons, mountain, forest and shining sand, used at the opening of the Parliamentary year in 2008.

Or 'The Great South Land'

1. This is our nation, this is our land this is a country of dreams gone dry a land of reaping, a land of harvest we see revival, the Spirit comes.

TiS 671 'Made in God's likeness' by Patricia Lewis mentions Australian native birds and animals such as the masked owl, kingfisher's laughter, and bower bird.

Or Elizabeth Smith's 'Where wide sky rolls down and touches red sand...' (TiS 188) In fact the whole hymn is full of contextual natural images, but they are not explicitly linked to liturgical seasons.

#### **Diurnal Influences**

There are several hymns currently in use beyond Australia that invoke the image of the daily turning of the earth.

TiS 458 'The day you gave us Lord is ended' by John Ellerton where verse 3 begins 'Across each continent and island/ as dawn leads on another day,/the voice of prayer is never silent,/ nor dies the strain of praise away.' And in verse 4, 'The sun that bids us rest is waking/our friends beneath the western sky...'

There are none that I have found that make explicit north and southern hemisphere references.

Of course 'The First Nowell' (TiS 301) verse 4, reads 'The star drew nigh to the north-west; over Bethlehem it took its rest...' which does beg a few questions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Bullock, Geoff 'Great Southland', *Praise and Worship*, Resource Christian Music Pty Ltd, 1995, 629.

as to the location of the observer but we have never let that question get in the way of firm singing of a good Epiphany carol. It is assumed that it is a description of those wise persons coming from the 'East', a term that is definitely Eurocentric!

### **Advent and Christmas**

It is Deidre Browne's 'Let the warmth of our love, like the long summer days' that reveals a definite southern approach to Advent:

Gather in hope, people of God, Sing the Advent song! Song of faith, song of trust, a song to welcome the Christ

- Let the warmth of our love, like the long summer days, prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord, Let our will for justice, as strong as the sun prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord.
- Let our thirst for the truth, like the dry, parched earth, prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord. Let our dream for peace, as bright as the sky, prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord.
- Let the prophet be heard, like the blaze of fire:
   prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord.
   Let the poor and the rich as the lamb and the lion,
   prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord.
- 4. Stand alert and be ready to welcome the Christ prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord. Let this be our pray'r as we lift up our hearts: prepare the way of the Lord, prepare the way of the Lord.

Or from Neil Quintrell in Adelaide, 'Hope Forever Born':

Long before the suns of summer turned above the ochred earth,
 God prepared for human knowing – a single, perfect point of light.
 Seeded deep within our dreaming, hope that hungers to be born.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> NLMC Publications and GIA Publications, *Gather Australia*, Melbourne and Chicago, 1995, hymn number 281

- Patiently the faithful pilgrims keep alive the precious dream, weave the truth in dance and story, shape the sacred songs of faith. Hold before our eyes a vision of the holy fire of hope.
- Spirit breathes across our desert, whispers that the time is now, when the silent sights of sadness are lifted in a baby's cry; and the evening stars sing glory of a hope forever born.
- Pilgrims, ours the Spirit-calling, bearers of the holy name.
   Carry hope conceived within us ever waiting to be born.
   Ours the star that blazes in the darkest night, Christ, our hope, forever born.
- 5. Ever sing the song of angels spoken new at every dawn, glory to God in the highest peace to all upon the earth. Christ our hope is born.

  Alleluia! Alleluia! Christ is born.

New Zealanders have explored the impact of Christmas celebrated in the summer rather more extensively. Some examples from *Carol our Christmas*<sup>14</sup> include:

- 1. Carol our Christmas, an upside down Christmas; snow is not falling and trees are not bare.

  Carol the summer, and welcome the Christ Child, warm in our sunshine and sweetness of air.
- Sing of the gold and the green and the sparkle, water and river and lure of the beach.
   Sing in the happiness of open spaces, sing a nativity summer can reach!

Words: Neil Quintrell, Tune: French Traditional Carol Melody. Songs for Pilgrims,
 Pilgrim Publishing, C/- Pilgrim Church, 12 Flinders Street, Adelaide, No 23
 Carol no. 7.

- 3. Shepherds and musterers move over hillsides, finding, not angels, but sheep to be shorn; wise one makes journeys whatever the season, searching for signs of the truth to be born.
- 4. Right side up Christmas belongs to the universe, made in the moment a woman gives birth; hope is the Jesus gift, love is the offering, everywhere, anywhere, here on the earth. <sup>15</sup>

## Or, another New Zealand carol:

- Above the peaks the angels sing, across the snow their voices ring, and musterers come riding down, to find the little country town where Christ is waiting to be born, our summer Child, this Christmas morn.
- 2. Across the hills the rata spread their signal fires of smokey red; by golden sands and whit'ning shell pohutukawa<sup>16</sup> flames to tell that Christ is waiting to be born, our summer Child, this Christmas morn.
- Beneath a Southern Cross of light, led by the Pointers, through the night three travellers are hast'ning home from distant lands to find their own; for Christ is waiting to be born, our summer Child, this Christmas morn.
- We too would sing that ancient song and join the busy, hurrying throng, and take the road once more to find

<sup>15</sup> Words: Shirley Murray .Tune: Colin Gibson

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The pohutukawa is the 'New Zealand Christmas tree' and blooms with red flowers in December.

that hallowed place in heart and mind where Christ is waiting to be born, our summer Child, this Christmas morn.<sup>17</sup>

Finally, although not well known or often sung, Bill Wallace does pose the question again,

- 1. Christmas in the summer?
  Heat instead of cold?
  Flowers instead of freezing?
  Skies that shine like gold?
  This is Southern Christmas,
  seasons in reverse!
  Can the Northern pictures
  speak in Southern verse?
- Inner space is timeless –
  God is everywhere –
  cries of newborn infants
  reach for Mary's care.
  When we nurture wonder
  'till its grace abounds
  we create new pictures
  outside Northern bounds.
- 3. Sing the Christmas story carol South and North sing of pregnant seasons, nature's songs of birth.

  Raise the Christ-child's praises lift both joy and pain, touch the realms of oneness, live the birth again. 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Words and Tune: Colin Gibson (Carol 2). Note the reference to the star constellation, the Southern Cross in verse 3. Other Christmas hymns from *Carol our Christmas* include: 6 'Awake before sunrise, before heat of day...', 11 'Christmas in the picture book, all gold and white with snow...', 13 'Come in, come in New Year with shining summer day...',16 'Come to this Christmas singing!..', 18 'From pastures green and tussock brown, where sheep come in for shearing ...', 38 'Sing a carol for summer, sing in Aotearoa,/island waters and mountain snow! /Feel the kiss of the sun on skin -/you know that summer's a coming in,/everything's getting ready for Christmas, /everyone's in a holiday mood.' Words: Shirley Murray. Tune: Jillian Bray

#### Easter

'Now the green blade rises from the buried grain....' is probably the hymn that roused my interest most in this exploration. It has found a place in the repertoire within our congregations even though the imagery is tied to the northern hemisphere and Spring celebration of Easter, a point well made by D'Arcy Wood in his commentary on the hymn <sup>20</sup>

- 1. Now the green blade rises from the buried grain, wheat that in the dark earth many days has lain: love lives again, that with the dead has been:

  Love has come again, like wheat that springs up green.
- 2. In the grave they laid him, love whom hate had slain, thinking that he never would awake again, laid in the earth, like grain that sleeps unseen.

  Love has come again...
- 3. Up he sprang at Easter, like the risen grain, he who for the three days in the grave had lain, raised from the dead my living Lord is seen:

  Love has come again...
- 4. When our hearts are wintry, grieving, or in pain, then your touch can call us back to life again fields of our hearts that dead and bare have been:

  Love has come again...

Another hymn that uses grain as the symbol is Pamela Stotter,

- 1. Christ is alive, with joy we sing; we celebrate our risen Lord, praising the glory of his name.

  Alleluia, alleluia, alleluia.
- 2. He is the grain of wheat that died, sown in distress and reaped in joy, yielding a harvest of new life.

  Alleluia, alleluia, alleluia.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Words: Bill Wallace. Tune: LATIMER David Childs, or CRANHAM.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Words: John Macleod Campbell Crum, 1872-1958. Tune: NOEL NOUVELET, TiS 382, *Songs for the People of God 4.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Milgate, Wesley and Wood, D'Arcy, op.cit., p. 283.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> TiS 393, first two of six verses. Words: Pamela Stotter, 1944-. Tune: VULPIUS 888 with alleluias.

Again D'Arcy Wood's notes<sup>22</sup> tell us that Pamela has been based at the Irish School of Ecumenics in Dublin and educated in Ireland and UK, so one might assume a northern hemisphere context in her mind; yet I would maintain this is still a potent image for us, sung as part of our Easter celebrations in mid Autumn in Australasia.

### Conclusion

Here are some fledgling examples of hymn writers depicting seasonally linked imagery. But this brief survey reveals there are not many examples of such hymns represented in the middle order hymn books in use in Australian Churches, such as *Together in Song* and *Gather Australia*. New Zealand hymn writers seem to have been more explicit in exploring imagery for Christmas and Easter hymns that evoke southern hemisphere seasonal contexts, eg Shirley Murray and Bill Wallace.

I wonder whether this is a question of confidence and maturity for hymn writers in this part of the world. Will we see more of such contextual expression in future writing? Or is it a shaping of which we are not always entirely conscious? I would contend that the seasonal back drop to the liturgical season does shape the understanding of theological motifs utilised in our worship. What we sing is a strong medium for shaping worshippers in their understanding of that symbol. Augustine was very aware of this, with his much quoted 'He who sings prays twice'; even if there is some suspicion that that is not an accurate quotation! It does make a difference to how we understand the death and resurrection of Easter if it is celebrated amidst autumn with leaves falling off trees, or in spring with new life bursting forth on bare branches. Similarly the sense of homelessness for the Holy Family may be heightened for northern hemisphere Christmas celebrations, when it is snowing and bleak out of doors. For Australians this is rather more muted as many of us harbour secret desires to be sufficiently abandoned to sleep at the beach.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Milgate, Wesley and Wood, D'Arcy, op.cit., p. 783.

# **Activities of the Academy Chapters**

### From Western Australia:

We are blessed with a great diversity of members both in terms of worship communities and of occupation! We usually meet about five times a year and welcome visitors. For the last few meetings we have been discussing Gary Bouma's book, *Australian Soul* and it has provided us with a great deal of material for wide ranging discussions about religion in Australia. Bouma is very positive about the health of the Australian Soul! We also spend time discussing special liturgies that members have lead or attended. They too are diverse and lead us in many interesting directions. One of our members is a monk from New Norcia monastery and he shared with us the recent funeral liturgies of their Abbott and also another monk who died earlier this year. Another member has recently been in Israel and shared liturgies that he and his family shared in Nazareth. A further liturgical discussion revolved around liturgy in prisons in Western Australia. Such diversity is a great source of interest and delight in our meetings. We conclude with a home cooked meal that always holds delightful surprises.

Convenor:

Dr Angela McCarthy 22 Maritime Avenue Kardinya Western Australia Phone: (08) 9337 9224

E-mail: amccarthy@nd.edu.au

# Visit to Australia of Fr Paul Turner STD (Sant' Anselmo), American sacramental theologian, 2009

Fr Paul Turner, a prolific writer of books and articles on the sacraments of Christian Initiation, liturgical ministry and preparation will be visiting Melbourne (Hobart and Adelaide) for a series of presentations in August 2009. Turner writes as both a theologian and pastor (St Munchin Parish, Diocese of Kansas City-St Joseph, MO) bringing a depth of historical knowledge, theological perception and pastoral wisdom to his scholarship. He also assists the ICEL secretariat as a facilitator for the meetings of bishops working on the revised missal texts and therefore has a unique perspective from which to view the revision process and the new texts themselves.

The following engagements in Melbourne are open to everyone.

- Lecture on the Revised Roman Catholic Missal Texts
   Thursday 27 August 2009 from 7:30-9:30pm.
   Cardinal Knox Lecture Theatre, 383 Albert Street, East Melbourne entry via Cathedral car-park off Lansdowne Street
   Information: Paul Taylor, Archbishop's Office for Evangelisation Phone: (03 9926 5753w)
- Guest Speaker at Victorian RCIA/Catechumenate State Conference Saturday 29 August 2009, c. 9am.- 5pm.
   Thomas Carr Centre, 278 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne Information: Carmel Crawford, Archbishop's Office for Evangelisation Phone (03 9926 5765w)

## **Tasmanian Chapter**

Paul Turner will be working in Tasmania before the Congress, speaking on the Sacraments of Initiation. The visit is being sponsored by the Archdiocese of Hobart and will incorporate a Public lecture as well as workshop sessions. Mark Francis and Keith Pecklers will present some sessions on the 2002 General Instruction on the Roman Missal after the Congress.

Our Chapter has not met yet – we hope to have a gathering before the Conference to review some papers and articles on the conference theme. The convenor has had a major commitment to publicity and visa applications in preparation for the congress!

Contact: cathy.murrowood@aohtas.org.au

## Victorian Chapter: seminar 'Marking Mortality'

The Victorian chapter is organizing a seminar on Friday 7 August on challenges and developments in the practice of funeral liturgy in the churches today. We hope to have some guests who are in Australia for the Societas Liturgica congress, but in particular, Prof. **Richard H. Rutherford** CSC, Drs Theol., University of Portland, Oregon, and current President of the North American Academy of Liturgy, will speak. Centre for Theology and Ministry, Parkville (off College Crescent, between Ormond and St Hilda's Colleges, street parking only). Details to be confirmed.

The 2009 Austin James Lecture will be given by Professor **David Holeton**, a Canadian Anglican on the Protestant Theological Faculty of the Charles University of Prague, Czech Republic, and outgoing President of Societas Liturgica, on Sunday 23 August. Details to be confirmed.

Convener: Albert McPherson, E-mail: abmcp@ozemail.com.au

# The Congress of Societas Liturgica, Sydney 2009 introduced by Carmel Pilcher

In a few short months more than 150 liturgists from at least 22 countries will gather for Societas Liturgica Congress XII in Sydney, Australia. For the local members of Societas this event has been a long time coming. The first invitation was issued more than a decade ago but Australians stood aside in favour of India. At a national gathering held in Brisbane in January 2003 the Academy of Liturgy unanimously agreed to once again offer to host a Societas Congress in Australia. As president at the time, I issued a formal invitation to the then president Dr Yngvill Martola from Finland. We made several serious presentations to subsequent Congresses in Europe and were eventually successful in our queSt Very soon we will experience what many of us hope will be a watershed for liturgical scholarship in Australia.

Societas Liturgica is an ecumenical society of liturgical scholars that was founded in Europe in the 1960's. In 1967 the first congress was held in the Netherlands and gatherings have occurred biennially ever since – except for the visit to India, in either Europe or the United States. Today there are more than 400 members of the society, from all parts of the globe. The current president is Rev Dr James Puglisi, an American who heads the Ecumenical Centre in Rome. He is assisted by an elected Council, two of whom are Australians Rev Dr Tom Elich from Brisbane, and Ms Jenny O'Brien from Adelaide. The Council determines the topic of a Congress. Fittingly for its visit to the Southern Hemisphere, the decision was made to focus on the Liturgical Year.

Keynote speakers include Austrian Professor Harald Buchinger, professor of liturgical studies at the University of Regensburg, who will speak on the development of the Liturgical Year since it was discussed at a Societas Congress in 1981; and German professor Dagmar Heller; who teaches ecumenical theology at the Ecumenical Institute Bossy in Geneva. Professor Anscar Chupungco from the Philippines is also presenting. Fr Chupungco taught for many years at Saint Anselmo in Rome and is noted for his seminal work on liturgy and culture. Three Academy members: Drs Charles Sherlock; Anita Munro and Tom Elich will combine to provide the fourth keynote entitled 'Liturgy and Time – Views from the Antipodes.' On the final day three younger scholars including Dr Clare Johnson will join the panel of presenters to review the findings of the Congress. In addition many short communications and case studies are promised and the program offers ample time for discussion and reflection.

The setting for the Congress is St Joseph's Spirituality Centre at Baulkham Hills, a small rural oasis in the western suburbs of Sydney, and a venue large enough to comfortably accommodate the participants. The program will begin with a formal welcome by local aboriginal elders and a reception by Christian heads of churches. It is always assumed that the hosts will enhance a Congress with a local flavour. On one evening we are reflecting our multicultural richness in the form of music and food from the Pacific and Asia. Perhaps the most significant contribution of the local committee is to provide the worship for the Congress. This has been carefully and thoroughly prepared by one of our most significant professors of liturgy and a musical composer of great renown.

We are in the process of securing sponsorship for a number of Indonesian liturgical scholars to attend the Congress. This is the consequence of an invitation to attend the Asian Liturgy Forum in Yogyakarta, Indonesia in 2008. The input of Asians would significantly enhance our own contribution and that of Societas. It is our hope that funding would be secured, not only for these, but also for one or two scholars from our Pacific neighbours.

An Australian flavour will be evident, not just from a strong local presence, but the traditional 'excursion' will showcase our harbour and our history, art and aboriginal heritage. The day will culminate in our Congress Eucharist in Australia's newest Cathedral at St Patrick's Parramatta, and of course the Aussie barbecue will be a feature. We will also treat our guests to beautiful sacred music from home grown internationally renowned professional musicians, *The Song Company*.

No venture of this size ever happens without many, many hours of preparation and organisation. The local committee continues to work hard and tirelessly, but when the Australian Academy invited Societas to Australia they also committed their support. Earlier this year our national meeting in Canberra served as a preparation for the Congress. The local presenters at the Congress workshopped their presentations and invited response from their colleagues. Since then many have volunteered to assist the local committee by taking responsibility for activities associated with the Congress. We have been inundated with registrations from Australia as many generously prepare to travel at great expense from all over the nation to participate. We look forward to even more members of the Society joining us from overseas as we eagerly await this historic event in the Australian church.

### The H.F. Leatherland Exhibition

The Melbourne College of Divinity, in conjunction with the Australian Academy of Liturgy, invites submissions for the 2009 'H.F. Leatherland Exhibition'.

In anticipation of the *Societas Liturgica* Congress, to be held in Sydney in August 2009, the theme of the 2009 Exhibition is

'Celebrating the Liturgical Year in Australia'.

Details of the award are as follows:

- The value of the Exhibition is \$500.
- The Exhibition, which is offered every two years, is open to any person in Australia currently enrolled in any of the following MCD degrees: BTheol; MDiv; MA by coursework; MTS.
- Students of other Australian theological colleges and consortia who are enrolled in equivalent degrees are also eligible to apply.
- The Exhibition may be awarded for an essay of 5,000 words on a subject in the field of Liturgical Studies, as approved by the MCD and the Victorian Chapter of the Australian Academy of Liturgy.
- In order to qualify for the Exhibition an essay must be judged to be of at least Distinction standard by two examiners, one of whom will be appointed by the MCD, and the other of whom will be appointed by the Victorian Chapter of the Australian Academy of Liturgy.
- The MCD and the Chapter reserve the right not to award the exhibition in any year.
- The essay may draw directly on material submitted in fulfilment of other course requirements but, in that case, is to be specifically prepared for the purposes of the Exhibition.
- The essay must contain a bibliography, and be referenced according to MCD style guides.
- Two copies of the essay shall be submitted. A third copy of any essay for which the Exhibition is awarded will be deposited in the H. F. Leatherland Collection of the Dalton-McCaughey Library, Parkville, Victoria.
- The Australian Journal of Liturgy has the first right of publication of any essay submitted for the Exhibition.

The closing date for submission for essays has been extended (from 1 June) to 13 July 2009. Teachers of liturgy please NOTE!

Submissions should be addressed to:

Rev. Professor Robert Gribben,

C/- Melbourne College of Divinity, 21 Highbury Grove, Kew 3101

### **Book Reviews**

Richard Giles, Mark Ireland, Ann Loades and Nicola Slee, *Journey. Renewing the Eucharist: Volume 1.* Series editor: Stephen Burns. Norwich: Canterbury Press, 2009. 117 pages, ISBN 978-1 853-118609.

This is the first in a series exploring the spirituality and practice of the Eucharist with particular reference to the traditions and styles of the Church of England. The proposed readership is the ordinary worshipper, and seekers who wish to gain insight into the EuchariSt

Five clear, succinct and readable chapters make up the text. Stephen Burns opens with a discussion of the Eucharist's shape, and an introduction to the following chapters, which are built around the liturgical forms of gathering, word, sacrament and sending.

Richard Giles serves 'gathering' well, with a comprehensive introduction to the many levels of meaning in the act of assembling, concluding with the way our gathering is God's initiative.

Nicola Slee guides the reader through the layers of hearing the word, attentive to the tension between holy writ and the Word who stands behind it. She keenly discusses proclamation, sermon, creed and intercession. I am not sure I can agree that the word can be easily rendered using multiple media (p.46), but she opens an important question and sets up the criterion of authentic engagement.

The chapter on 'sacrament' strays from the structure of the others: Ann Loades speaks more broadly of sacramentality and less of the liturgical rite. Her material is interesting and challenging, yet something more direct on the implications of the Eucharist would help readers to worship using the rite.

The concluding chapter by Mark Ireland on 'sending' is broad ranging, mission oriented and replete with options, without losing sight of who comprises the contemporary worshipping community.

This is the sort of text that successfully informs and enlightens the laity, allows for an ecumenical readership, and makes sense of the liturgy to those seekers in our midst.

Gerard Moore

Elizabeth J Smith, Songs for Saints and Sinners. Twenty-two new texts for 21<sup>st</sup> century worship, with eight new tunes by Rosalyn Carolane and Alexander Scutt (Melbourne: BEAUT Resources, St John's Anglican Church, Bentleigh, 2008).

Elizabeth Smith's latest set of song texts offers a fresh resource, encouraging worship leaders to draw on new expressions for our praise and contemplation of God.

In her preface, Elizabeth encourages us to 'stretch ourselves and our congregations spiritually, with words that are theologically rich, and music that is not only catchy but also sophisticated.' By 'sophisticated' she does not mean 'high culture' music, but tunes 'with clever harmonies that illustrate the words, interesting rhythms that ground the music in our bodies as we sing, and tunes that are far from generic.'

This is a timely reminder of the need for musicians and leaders to keep exploring the range of musical expression for worship. Most of Elizabeth's work uses existing hymn tunes; this book also includes new, readily picked-up tunes to match eight specific texts.

Two texts provide paraphrases of the Gloria - useful for congregations who don't often sing a musical setting for the eucharist, and those who could do with a change.

Songs are included, to enrich our singing with the saints – Peter, Andrew, John, Anne – along with songs about ending poverty and caring for the environment. There is a particularly accessible hymn for use at funerals – 'Here at journey's end we meet you' - set to the tune of 'All through the night'.

A CD is available for the easy transfer of texts under the usual licensing systems. The CD also includes copies of the new tunes and a basic MIDI track for each to facilitate learning. Notes by the writer give a short paragraph on the origins of each song text.

As with Elizabeth's previous material, these song texts are well-constructed in form, free from re-cycled clichés, delightfully straightforward in their statements, yet contain sufficient challenge to test our perceptions and assumptions.

Making use of this material is another way of keeping our practice of worship moving forward, our faith considering new challenges. As one text says,

We are travellers who go where as yet we don't know, though the journey will last our life through. The adventures we share and the dangers we dare bring us closer to all things made new. (refrain)

To proclaim Jesus' love and to worship and serve in the strength of the Spirit of grace, is our joy and our goal till the world is made whole to the glorious Trinity's praise.

Copies are available from St John's, Bentleigh, Vic.

Phone: (03 9557 2226)

E-mail: <u>bentleighanglican@bigpond.com</u> Cost: book \$22, CD \$16.50, postage \$1.

Fay Magee

### **Contributors**

The Rev. Dr **John Bunyan** was for 22 years Rector of Chester Hill with Sefton in the Diocese of Sydney. Before and since retirement he has been Hon. Chaplain of Bankstown Hospital, and Hon.Chaplain of the Australian Intelligence Association. He is a parishioner of St John the Baptist's, Canberra (although living in Campbelltown) and a member of King's Chapel, Boston, USA (noted for its unitarian Book of Common Prayer).

Dr Clare V. Johnson is Senior Lecturer in Sacramental Theology at The University of Notre Dame Australia (Fremantle).

**Fay Magee** is a research master's student of the Melbourne College of Divinity, undertaking a thesis exploring the effect of social, architectural and ecclesial contexts on musical resources.

Associate Professor **Gerard Moore** is Director (Research), Sydney College of Divinity, and the author of a several books introducing Roman Catholic rites to ordinary worshippers.

**Nathan Nettleton** is a pastor to the South Yarra Community Baptist Church and lectures in liturgical studies at Whitley College, the Baptist College of Victoria. His MTheol from the Melbourne College of Divinity included a thesis on the liturgical expression of Baptist Identity.

**Paul Taylor,** with Master's degrees in liturgy and in music, works at the Archbishop's Office for Evangelisation in Melbourne as Coordinator of Liturgy and Worship. He serves as an Assistant Organist at St Patrick's Cathedral and St Francis' Church, Lonsdale Street and is working on a PhD at Australian Catholic University on the ministerial and congregational singing of chant in Melbourne's Catholic parishes.

Alison Whish is an ordained minister of the Uniting Church in Australia, currently serving in Tasmania as Presbytery Minister — Leadership Development. A significant part of this new role is support and equipping of Lay Preachers and other lay leaders of worship. As a sometimes member of various choirs over the years, Alison has a particular interest in the place of music in worship.

### AUSTRALIAN ACADEMY OF LITURGY

### COUNCIL 2009

PRESIDENT: David Pitman, BA, BD, DipEd, PhD

PAST PRESIDENT: Carmel Pilcher rsj, DipT, GradDipRE, MA, PhD

SECRETARY: Elizabeth Harrington, BA, BEcon, CertT, GradDipTheol.

TREASURER: John de Lange, BA, BD, GradDipA

EDITOR OF AJL: Robert Gribben BA, MA, TheolM, DD (h.c.)

**CHAPTER CONVENORS:** 

QLD Inari Thiel, MSc, MA, GradDipTheol

NSW Paul Mason, BE (Elec), MA (Theol), MA (Liturgy)

ACT Vicki Cullen, BA, BTh, MEd, Dip Min

VIC Albert McPherson, MA, STM

TAS Cathy Murrowood, BA, DipEd, GradDipTheol, MA

SA Ilsa Neicinieks RSM, MEd, MA (Lit Studs)
WA Angela McCarthy, BA, BEd, MEd (RE), PhD

### MEMBERSHIP OF THE ACADEMY

Admission to the Academy is open to those who have recognised qualifications in liturgical studies and related disciplines. The Academy also admits those who have demonstrated in other ways their professional competence in these fields or who evidence a developing contribution in the area of worship.

The Academy hopes that the work of members will serve to animate the liturgical spirit of the traditions and congregations to which they belong.

Applications are invited and should be made on an application form available from:

The Secretary
Australian Academy of Liturgy
c/- Liturgical Commission
GPO Box 282
Brisbane Qld 4001

The annual membership fee is \$37.00 (GST incl.) The membership fee includes subscription to *AJL*.

The new Editor, **Robert Gribben**, held the chair of Worship and Mission at the Uniting Church Theological College for the last ten years, and is now Professor Emeritus. He is a former President of the Academy and Council member of Societas Liturgica. His most recent book is *Uniting in Thanksgiving: The Great Prayers of Thanksgiving of the Uniting Church in Australia*, Uniting Academic Press, Melbourne 2008.

### AJL ADDRESSES

MANUSCRIPTS FOR PUBLICATION to:

The Editor, AJL

22 Illawarra Road, Balwyn North, Vic. 3104

Phone: (03) 9859 1750

E-mail: rgribben@ozemail.com.au

Authors preparing manuscripts are requested to follow the AGPS *Style Manual*. The author-date system of citation is preferred. *Australian Journal of Liturgy* should be abbreviated as *AJL*.

Articles should not normally exceed 5,000 words in length. Articles may be presented on PC disc or CD in rich text format (.rtf). A hard copy should accompany the disc/CD. Copy may be sent to the editor by e-mail.

Only articles not previously published and not under consideration for publication elsewhere will be accepted. All articles submitted will be reviewed by the *AJL* editorial panel or other reviewers with appropriate expertise. *AJL* is registered in the DEST Register of Refereed Journals.

BOOKS FOR REVIEW to:

The Rev. Dr C H Sherlock

PO Box 2,

Bendigo 3552

SUBSCRIPTION PAYMENTS and all other business communications (including notice of change of address) to:

The Secretary

Australian Academy of Liturgy

c/- Liturgical Commission

GPO Box 282

Brisbane 4001

*AJL* is sent anywhere in the world for an annual subscription of \$AUD20.00 if paid in Australian currency. If paid in any other currency the subscription is the equivalent of \$AUD30.00. For members of the Academy, subscription to *AJL* is included in the membership fee.

Advertising is accepted: \$20 per half page.

